

The potential and value of objective eye tracking in the Ophthalmology clinic

Clark, Rosie; Blundell, James; Dunn, Matthew; Erichsen, Jonathan; Giardini, Mario; Gottlob, Irene; Harris, Chris; Lee, Helena; Mcilreavy, Lee; Olson, Andrew; Self, Jay; Vinuela-Navarro, Valldeflors; Waddington, Johnathan; Woodhouse, J Margaret; Gilchrist, Iain; Williams, Cathy

DOI:

[10.1038/s41433-019-0417-z](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41433-019-0417-z)

License:

Other (please specify with Rights Statement)

Document Version

Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Clark, R, Blundell, J, Dunn, M, Erichsen, J, Giardini, M, Gottlob, I, Harris, C, Lee, H, Mcilreavy, L, Olson, A, Self, J, Vinuela-Navarro, V, Waddington, J, Woodhouse, JM, Gilchrist, I & Williams, C 2019, 'The potential and value of objective eye tracking in the Ophthalmology clinic', *Eye*, vol. 33, no. 8, pp. 1200–1202.

<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41433-019-0417-z>

[Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal](#)

Publisher Rights Statement:

This is a post-peer-review, pre-copyedit version of an article published in *Eye*. The final authenticated version is available online at: <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41433-019-0417-z>

General rights

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

- Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.
- Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.
- User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?)
- Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

1 Title:THE POTENTIAL AND VALUE OF OBJECTIVE EYE TRACKING IN THE
2 OPHTHALMOLOGY CLINIC

3

4 **Authors**

5 Rosie Clark, Population Health Sciences, Bristol Medical School, Bristol University,
6 Bristol, UK

7 James Blundell, Institute of Future Transport and Cities, Coventry University, UK

8 Matt J Dunn, School of Optometry and Vision Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff,
9 UK

10 Jonathan T Erichsen, School of Optometry and Vision Sciences, Cardiff University,
11 Cardiff, UK

12 Mario E Giardini, Department of Biomedical Engineering, University of Strathclyde,
13 Glasgow, UK

14 Irene Gottlob, Department of Neuroscience, Psychology & Behaviour, University of
15 Leicester, Leicester, UK

16 Chris Harris, School of Psychology Plymouth University, UK & Royal Eye Infirmary,
17 Derriford Hospital, Plymouth UK

18 Helena Lee, Clinical and Experimental Sciences, University of Southampton, UK

19 Lee Mcilreavy, School of Optometry and Vision Sciences, Cardiff University,
20 Cardiff, UK

21 Andrew Olson, School of Psychology, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

22 Jay E Self, Clinical and Experimental Sciences, University of Southampton. UK
23 Valldeflors Vinuela-Navarro, Ophthalmic Research Group, Life and Health
24 Sciences, Aston University, UK
25 Jonathan Waddington, Research and Development, WESC Foundation, Exeter, UK
26 J Margaret Woodhouse, School of Optometry and Vision Sciences, Cardiff
27 University, Cardiff, UK
28 Iain D Gilchrist, School of Psychological Science, Bristol University, Bristol, UK
29 Cathy Williams, Population Health Sciences, Bristol Medical School, Bristol
30 University, Bristol, UK

31

32 Correspondence to:

33 Cathy Williams, Population Health Sciences, Bristol Medical School, Bristol 1-5
34 Whiteladies Road, Clifton, Bristol BS8 1NU

35

36

37 Conflicts of Interest

38 The authors have no conflicts of interest.

39

40 Running title: Objective Eye Tracking in the clinic

41

42

43

44

45 **Main Text**

46 Numerous research studies have demonstrated the scope and value of eye
47 movement recording (EMR). There is now potential for EMR to be helpful in a
48 range of clinical contexts and it could be developed as a routine part of the
49 repertoire of clinical investigations offered by the NHS, at least in tertiary centres.
50 We highlight potential uses and challenges below, as a prelude to further
51 development and debate.

52 *Diagnosis*

53 EMR in patients with nystagmus is already increasingly used clinically and provides
54 the only method for identifying the exact waveform[1, 2]. A classic example is
55 identifying the characteristic accelerating waveform of infantile nystagmus
56 syndrome (INS), which obviates the need for urgent investigations of newly-
57 diagnosed nystagmus, saving the patients and the NHS time and money. EMR
58 may also indicate the cause of an abnormal head posture (AHP) and identify the
59 best option for treatment. For example, an AHP may be adopted to use a null point
60 in subclinical, previously undiagnosed INS, or to put an eye into adduction if the
61 patient has latent nystagmus.

62 However, EMR can help in the management of patients other than those with
63 nystagmus. Examples include:

64 In Parkinson's disease, EMRs of saccades help differentiate between dementia
65 with Lewy bodies, progressive supranuclear palsy, corticobasal degeneration, and
66 multiple system atrophy[3].

67 EMR will differentiate between Gaucher Disease Type 1 and Type 3[4]. This is
68 particularly important, as there are different treatment pathways for these patient
69 groups. Abnormal EMR metrics have also been reported in children with three rare
70 metabolic diseases: Tyrosinemia III, Niemann Pick C and Morquio syndrome[5, 6] –
71 potentially allowing treatment to be started earlier in the disease process[6].

72 In psychiatry, EMR performance on the antisaccade task is affected (see:[7]) and
73 EMR metrics have been used to classify cases of schizophrenia vs controls with
74 87-98% accuracy [8] which again may allow earlier and more accurate diagnosis,
75 with earlier treatment and support.

76 *Screening of at-risk individuals*

77 There is a growing body of evidence that EMR may be useful in the screening of
78 individuals at risk of disorders including Huntington's[9], Alzheimer's[10, 11] and
79 Parkinson's[12] Diseases.

80 *Monitoring of disease progression and of response to treatment*

81 The EMR abnormalities in Niemann Pick C, including curved saccades, increase in
82 magnitude with disease severity suggesting that these measures would also be
83 useful in monitoring disease progression. Also, in Parkinson's Disease, the extent
84 of EMR abnormalities is related to disease progression[13] and responsiveness to
85 treatment[14].

86 Although these results are encouraging, it is likely that EMR alone will only rarely, if
87 ever, be used as the only diagnostic criterion. However diagnostic pathways which
88 include EMR alongside, for example MR imaging[15], are likely to be shorter and
89 more accurate. Whilst the individual conditions may be rare, such as the metabolic
90 disorders, there are a much larger number of patients who present with early or
91 non-specific difficulties in whom treatable metabolic or neurological disease needs
92 to be ruled out, and therefore, specialist services that care for many patient groups
93 may benefit from access to reliable EMR within the NHS.

94 The objective and quantitative measurement of eye movements has a long history
95 dating back to the early 20th Century[16]. Early methods were uncomfortable and
96 invasive, and analysis of the resulting data was time-consuming. However, the
97 advent of both powerful personal computing and fast video-based recording
98 systems has led to a step-change in the last 15 years in this technology. EMR has
99 become standard in a wide range of settings including Consumer Research,
100 Human-Computer Interaction and Virtual Reality. Alongside this, work on both the
101 neurophysiology of eye movement control[17] and the detailed study of human eye
102 movement behaviour[18] means that we can map this visual-motor behaviour onto
103 the patterns of activity across a well studied and extensive brain network.

104 Routine recording of eye movements in a specialist clinical setting is now therefore
105 technically feasible and would provide a sensitive, quantitative and objective
106 method to aid diagnosis and management for a range of patients. However, despite
107 this potential benefit as a clinical tool, there are considerable challenges associated
108 with both introducing eye tracking into clinical practice and making it cost-effective.
109 We are still some way from having eye tracking hardware that is able to
110 successfully record the eye movements of every patient, whatever their age and

111 level of ability. We need a common suite of behavioural assays that are agreed
112 upon by the wider community, with normative data[19].

113 We would need to identify which groups of staff would carry out the assessments,
114 what training they would need, and how and by whom the resulting data should be
115 reported. One model is to develop inbuilt test paradigms and proforma reports that
116 include normative data, to limit the expertise required by the individual setting up
117 the test and make EMR accessible to a range of users. However, this highlights the
118 important issue of expertise in interpreting clinical eye movements. EMR may be
119 used to look for very specific abnormalities in an individual patient and a targeted
120 approach (as opposed to a general battery of tests) may be important for efficiency
121 and to address the key clinical question for that patient, especially for children. The
122 choice between a targeted or comprehensive approach requires both technical
123 ability and specific expertise. Training is required, but experience is also important
124 (as any clinician knows). Currently, there is no training offered and no recognised
125 training pathway. One possible route is to set up training for eye movement clinical
126 scientists, which could eventually become registrable with the Health and Care
127 Professions Council (HCPC). As an example, one of us (CH) is registered with the
128 HCPC as a 'Clinical Scientist' (which is a protected title) with designated expertise
129 in eye movements (the only one we are aware of). This avenue could be explored
130 as a way forward to formalise (and regulate) clinical oculomotor expertise.

131 EMR is already widely used in advertising, the aviation industry, rehabilitation
132 services, computer gaming and virtual reality equipment. The time has come to
133 explore how best to deploy this technology to the benefit of patients and the NHS.

134

135

136 **References**

137

- 138 1. Papageorgiou, E., McLean, R. J., Gottlob, I., *Nystagmus in childhood*. Pediatric
139 Neonatology, 2014. **55**: p. 341-351.
- 140 2. Dunn, M., *Clinical assessment of nystagmus*. Optometry Today, 2016. **56**: p. 80-85.
- 141 3. Armstrong, R. A., *Oculo-visual dysfunction in Parkinson's disease*. Journal of
142 Parkinson's disease, 2015. **5**(4): p. 715-726.
- 143 4. Harris, C. M., Taylor, D. S., Vellodi, A., *Ocular motor abnormalities in Gaucher*
144 *disease*. Neuropediatrics, 1999. **30**: p. 289-293.
- 145 5. Blundell, J., Frisson, S., Chakrapani, A., Kearney, S., Vijay, S., MacDonald, A., ... &
146 Olson, A., *Markers of cognitive function in individuals with metabolic disease:*
147 *Morquio syndrome and tyrosinemia type III*. Cognitive neuropsychology, 2018. **35**(3-
148 4): p. 120-147.
- 149 6. Blundell, J., Frisson, S., Chakrapani, A., Gissen, P., Hendriksz, C., Vijay, S., Olson,
150 A., *Oculomotor abnormalities in children with Niemann-Pick type C*. Molecular
151 Genetics and Metabolism, 2018. **123**: p. 159-168.
- 152 7. Hutton, S. B., Ettinger, U., *The antisaccade task as a research tool in*
153 *psychopathology: a critical review*. Psychophysiology, 2006. **43**: p. 302–313.
- 154 8. Benson, P.J., Beedie, S. A., Shephard, E., Giegling, I., Rujescu, D., St Clair, D.,
155 *Simple Viewing Tests Can Detect Eye Movement Abnormalities That Distinguish*
156 *Schizophrenia Cases from Controls with Exceptional Accuracy*. Biological Psychiatry,
157 2012. **72**: p. 716-724.
- 158 9. Blekher, T. M., Yee, R. D., Kirkwood, S. C., Hake, A. M., Stout, J. C., Weaver, M. R.,
159 & Foroud, T. M., *Oculomotor control in asymptomatic and recently diagnosed*
160 *individuals with the genetic marker for Huntington's disease*. Vision research, 2004.
161 **44**(23): p. 2729-2736.

- 162 10. Crawford, T. J., Higham, S., Renvoize, T., Patel, J., Dale, M., Suriya, A., Tetley, S.,
163 *Inhibitory control of saccadic eye movements and cognitive impairment in*
164 *Alzheimer's disease*. *Biological Psychiatry*, 2005. **57**(9): p. 1052-1060.
- 165 11. Boxer, A. L., Garbutt, S., Seeley, W. W., Jafari, A., Heuer, H. W., Mirsky, J.,
166 Hellmuth, J., Trojanowski, J. Q., Huang, E., DeArmond, S., Neuhaus, J., *Saccade*
167 *abnormalities in autopsy-confirmed frontotemporal lobar degeneration and Alzheimer*
168 *disease*. *Archives of Neurology*, 2012. **69**(4): p. 509-517.
- 169 12. White, O. B., Saint-Cyr, J. A., Tomlinson, R. D., Sharpe J. A., *Ocular motor deficits in*
170 *Parkinson's disease. II. Control of the saccadic and smooth pursuit systems*. *Brain*,
171 1983. **106**(3): p. 571-587.
- 172 13. Jankovic, J., *Parkinson's disease: clinical features and diagnosis*. *Journal of*
173 *neurology, neurosurgery & psychiatry*, 2008. **79**(4): p. 368-376.
- 174 14. Hood, A. J., Amador, S. C., Cain, A. E., Briand, K. A., Al-Refai, A. H., Schiess, M. C.,
175 Sereno, A. B., *Levodopa slows prosaccades and improves antisaccades: an eye*
176 *movement study in Parkinson's disease*. *Journal of neurology, neurosurgery &*
177 *psychiatry*, 2007. **78**(6): p. 565-570.
- 178 15. Rodrigue, A. L., Schaeffer, D. J., Pierce, J. E., Clementz, B. A., McDowell, J. E.,
179 *Evaluating the Specificity of Cognitive Control Deficits in Schizophrenia Using*
180 *Antisaccades, Functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging, and Healthy Individuals*
181 *With Poor Cognitive Control*. *Frontiers in Psychiatry*, 2018. **9**: p. 107.
- 182 16. Wade, N. J., Tatler, B. W., *Origins and applications of eye movement research.*, in
183 *The Oxford Handbook of Eye Movements*, I. D. Gilchrist & S. Everling, Eds. 2011,
184 Oxford University Press: Oxford.
- 185 17. Wurtz, R. H., *Using perturbations to identify the brain circuits underlying active vision*.
186 *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B*, 2015. **370**: p. 20140205.
- 187 18. Liversedge, S.P., Gilchrist, I. D. & Everling, S., *The Oxford Handbook of Eye*
188 *Movements*. 2011, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

189 19. Antoniadou, C., Ettinger, U., Gaymard, B., Gilchrist, I. D., Kristjansson, A., Kennard,
190 C., Leigh, J., Noorani, I., Pouget, P., Smyrnis, N., Tarnowski, A., Zee, D. &
191 Carpenter, R. H. S., *An internationally standardised antisaccade protocol for clinical*
192 *use*. Vision Research, 2013. **84**: p. 1-5.

193

194

195

196 **Footnotes:**

197 None

198 **Contributors:**

199 All authors contributed to the drafting and/or revision of this article. The manuscript
200 was coordinated by RC, IDG and CW.

201

202 **Funding:**

203 The work was supported by a grant from the UK Engineering and Physical
204 Sciences Research Council (EP/M000885/1) to the Bristol Vision Institute which
205 supported RC and a one day workshop on this topic at the University of Bristol on
206 24 April 2018. CW is supported by a NIHR senior research fellowship (SRF208-
207 015).

208

209 **Competing interests:**

210 None

211

212 **Ethics approval:**

213 Not applicable

214

215 **Provenance and peer review:**

216 Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.