# UNIVERSITY<sup>OF</sup> BIRMINGHAM University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

# Environmental crises at the Permian–Triassic mass extinction

Dal Corso, Jacopo; Song, Haijun; Callegaro, Sara; Chu, Daoliang; Sun, Yadong; Hilton, Jason; Grasby, Steve; Joachimski, Michael; Wignall, Paul

DOI: 10.1038/s43017-021-00259-4

License: Other (please specify with Rights Statement)

Document Version Peer reviewed version

#### Citation for published version (Harvard):

Dal Corso, J, Song, H, Callegaro, S, Chu, D, Sun, Y, Hilton, J, Grasby, S, Joachimski, M & Wignall, P 2022, 'Environmental crises at the Permian–Triassic mass extinction', *Nature Reviews Earth & Environment*, vol. 3, no. 3, pp. 197–214. https://doi.org/10.1038/s43017-021-00259-4

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

#### Publisher Rights Statement:

This version of the article has been accepted for publication, after peer review (when applicable) and is subject to Springer Nature's AM terms of use, but is not the Version of Record and does not reflect post-acceptance improvements, or any corrections. The Version of Record is available online at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/s43017-021-00259-4

#### **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?) •Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

#### Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

# Environmental crises at the Permian–Triassic mass extinction

2	Jacopo Dal Corso <sup>1</sup> *, Haijun Song <sup>1</sup> *, Sara Callegaro <sup>2</sup> , Daoliang Chu <sup>1</sup> , Yadong Sun <sup>3</sup> , Jason Hilton <sup>4</sup> ,
3	Stephen E. Grasby <sup>5</sup> , Michael M. Joachimski <sup>5</sup> , Paul B. Wignall <sup>6</sup> *
4	<sup>1</sup> State Key Laboratory of Biogeology and Environmental Geology, School of Earth Science, China
5	University of Geosciences, Wuhan, China.
6	<sup>2</sup> Centre for Earth Evolution and Dynamics, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway.
7	<sup>3</sup> GeoZentrum Nordbayern, Friedrich-Alexander Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg (FAU), Erlangen,
8	Germany.
9 10	<sup>4</sup> School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK.
11	<sup>5</sup> Geological Survey of Canada, Natural Resources Canada, Calgary, Alberta, Canada.
12	<sup>6</sup> School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK.
13	
14	*Correspondence should be addressed to J. Dal Corso (j.dalcorso@cug.edu.cn), Haijun Song
15	(haijunsong@cug.edu.cn), and P.B. Wignall (P.B.Wignall@leeds.ac.uk).
16 17	Key points
18	• The Permian–Triassic mass extinction (252 Ma) resulted in a substantial reduction of global
19	biodiversity, with the extinction of 81–94% of marine species and 70% of terrestrial
20	vertebrate families.
21	• Sedimentary, palaeontological and geochemical records during the mass extinction indicate
22	that a cascade of environmental changes caused the extinction.
23	• The environmental changes can be linked (and attributed to) the effects of volcanic emissions
24	
- 1	(for example CO <sub>2</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> , and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous
25	(for example CO <sub>2</sub> , SO <sub>2</sub> , and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous province.
25 26	<ul> <li>(for example CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous province.</li> <li>Inferred volcanically driven environmental perturbations include global warming, oceanic</li> </ul>
25 26 27	<ul> <li>(for example CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous province.</li> <li>Inferred volcanically driven environmental perturbations include global warming, oceanic anoxia, oceanic acidification, and (potentially) ozone reduction, acid rain, and metal</li> </ul>
25 26 27 28	<ul> <li>(for example CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous province.</li> <li>Inferred volcanically driven environmental perturbations include global warming, oceanic anoxia, oceanic acidification, and (potentially) ozone reduction, acid rain, and metal poisoning.</li> </ul>
25 26 27 28 29	<ul> <li>(for example CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and metals) during the eruption of the Siberian Traps large igneous province.</li> <li>Inferred volcanically driven environmental perturbations include global warming, oceanic anoxia, oceanic acidification, and (potentially) ozone reduction, acid rain, and metal poisoning.</li> <li>The crisis on land likely started ~60–370 kyrs before that in the ocean, indicating different</li> </ul>

- The causes of marine extinctions are inferred from geochemical and sedimentary evidence,
- but the reasons for the earlier terrestrial ecological crises remain poorly understood, but likely
   include rapid atmospheric change.

#### 34 Abstract

The link between the Permian–Triassic mass extinction (PTME; 252 Ma) and the emplacement of the 35 Siberian Traps Large Igneous Province (STLIP) was first proposed over 30 years ago. However, the 36 complex cascade of volcanic-driven environmental and biological events that led to the largest known 37 extinction in life's history is still difficult to reconstruct. In this Review, we critically evaluate the 38 geologic evidence and discuss the current hypotheses surrounding PTME kill mechanisms. Data 39 indicate that the initial STLIP extrusive/pyroclastic volcanism was coeval with widspread crisis of 40 terrestrial biota and marine animal species stress at high northern latitudes. The following onset of 41 extensive magmatic intrusions is linked with the rapid (~60 kyr) extinction of 81–94% of marine 42 species. The terrestrial to deep water extinctions are thought to have been caused by a combination of 43 global environmental perturbations driven by the emissions from STLIP. Nevertheless, it remains 44 difficult to understand the ultimate reason for the exceptional severity of the PTME. Future research 45 needs improved geochronology of STLIP and sedimentary sequences (especially terrestrial) to better 46 resolve the timing of volcanic phases and extinctions. Further ecological and physiological studies are 47 needed to understand temporal and spatial extintion patterns. Improved modelling is necessary to 48 reconstruct the causal relations between volcanism, environmental perturbations and ecosystem 49 collapse. 50

51

#### 52 Introduction

Many mass extinction [G] events punctuated the history of life and changed evolutionary trajectories <sup>54</sup> <sup>1</sup>. Most of past biological crises are coeval with the emplacement of Large Igneous Provinces (LIPs) <sup>55</sup> [G], which drove widespread environmental perturbations. LIP emissions of  $CO_2$  and other gasses are <sup>56</sup> comparable to current anthropogenic emissions, and future climate projections predict a scenario <sup>57</sup> similar to the major Phanerozoic extinctions. Hence, undestanding past events will help define the <sup>58</sup> tipping points that lead to a major biological crisis <sup>2</sup>.

- The Permian–Triassic mass extinction (PTME; 252 Ma) was the most severe biological crisis of the Phanerozoic (Fig. 1). It almost competely eliminated Palaeozoic fauna and flora, setting the stage for the evolution of modern ecosystems. Across the Permian–Triassic boundary (PTB), 81–94% of marine species went extinct <sup>3–5</sup> (Fig. 2 and 3). On land, 89% of tetrapod genera and 49% of families disappeared <sup>6</sup> (Fig. 4). Recovery began in the Early Triassic <sup>7–9</sup>, but became significant only in the
- 64 Middle Triassic, five million years later  $^{10-12}$ .

- <sup>65</sup> Data from the fossil, sedimentary, and geochemical record of the PTME suggest there were major
- environmental changes in marine and terrestrial settings  $^{13-15}$  (Fig. 2 and 3). The global crisis is
- $_{67}$  coeval with the emplacement of the Siberian Traps Large Igneous Province (STLIP)  $^{16-18}$  (Fig. 5),

that saw a relatively rapid (<1 Ma) eruption of 2–7 million  $\text{km}^{3}$  <sup>19–22</sup> of basalt, together with volcanic

emissions of CO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, halogens and metals that were capable of causing global climate and

<sup>70</sup> environmental catastrophe.

- 71 Detailed timing of events has improved remarkably in recent years thanks to advances in high-
- <sup>72</sup> precision radioisotope dating [G], and high-resolution biostratigraphy [G] and chemostratigraphy [G]
- <sup>73</sup> studies (especially C-isotope and Hg stratigraphy; BOX 1 and 2). Analysis of events from 252 million
- <sup>74</sup> years ago at a high temporal resolution allowed identification of distinct phases of STLIP eruptions
- <sup>18,23</sup> and separate pulses of extinction among marine animals <sup>4,24,25</sup>. Particularly interesting
- <sup>76</sup> developments include the increasing evidence that the terrestrial crisis was very likely underway
- several tens to hundreds of thousands of years before the marine extinction  $^{26-28}$ , clearly indicating
- that the PTME was not a single, instantaneous catastrophic event. Whilst these findings are expanding
- <sup>79</sup> knowledge of STLIP volcanism, environmental changes, and extinction patterns, linking them
- 80 remains difficult. The geological record tells a complex and partly obscure story of multiple, co-
- occurring phenomena, all playing a role in perturbing the ecosystems, and all probably interlinked in a
   cascade of environmental disasters.
- In this Review we discuss the PTME pattern in the ocean and on land, the age and volcanic style of the STLIP, the evidence of a link between STLIP phases and the PTME, and the environmental crises triggered by the volcanic emissions and their role in the extinction and observed selectivity. We discuss the apparent diachrony between some recorded environmental changes and extinctions. We then construct a likely chronology of the events based on the current evidence, propose a working hypothesis for future research, and highlight the open problems.
- 89

#### 90 Pattern of the PTME

<sup>91</sup> The exact temporal relationship between the marine and terrestrial extinctions is still debated.

<sup>92</sup> However, there is increasing evidence for an earlier onset of the terrestrial crisis and marine stress at

high northern latitudes. The age and pattern of the marine PTME at low latitudes are very well

<sup>94</sup> constrained, and these provide a stratigraphic framework that allows the level of terrestrial crisis to be

<sup>95</sup> pinpointed. Here we examine the marine crisis first.

*Marine extinction*. Across the PTB, the Palaeozoic evolutionary fauna [G] was devastated at all
 ecological levels, resulting in the largest marine extinction of the entire Phanerozoic (Fig. 1a and
 Supplementary Information). It has been estimated that 81–94% of marine species went extinct <sup>3–5</sup>.

The PTME appears to have been selective (Fig. 3). Some groups completely disappeared, such as 99 trilobites, rugose and tabulate corals, fusulinid foraminifers, and blastoid echinoderms <sup>4,29–31</sup>; others, 100 such as rhynchonelliforms (articulate brachiopods), crinoids, stenolaemate bryozoans, calcisponges, 101 radiolarians, ammonoids, and ostracods, came close to annihilation with only a handful of surviving 102 species <sup>4,32</sup>; whilst a few groups, including bivalves, gastropods, conodonts, and fishes, experienced 103 "only" severe to moderate extinction rates  $^{4,33-35}$  (Fig. 2). Extinction selectivity is not only evident in 104 the taxonomic composition of the marine fauna, but also in ecological and physiological traits. Body-105 size selectivity is seen in foraminifers, conodonts brachiopods, and bivalves <sup>36–39</sup>, with larger bodied 106 organisms showing higher extinction rates, but this factor is less obvious in other groups <sup>34,36,40</sup> (Fig. 107 3). 108

It has been shown that physiologically buffered taxa that can regulate intracellular chemistry and
counterbalance environmental chemical changes, like molluscs, ostracods, arthropods, and fish,
experienced lower extinction rates than unbuffered taxa such as brachiopods and echinoderms <sup>41–44</sup>
(Fig. 3). Moreover, non-motile taxa could in general be affected more by changing environmental
conditions than motile animals, especially swimming animals <sup>12</sup>: Fish were relatively little affected
compared to other groups <sup>44</sup>. However, statistical analysis shows that selectivity between these two
groups was not significant (Fig. 3).

116 Taxa with limited geographic distribution are generally more prone to extinction than widely

distributed groups because they are more dependent on local environmental conditions. However, this

phenomenon is not so strong during the PTME <sup>43,45,46</sup> (Fig. 3), suggesting harsh marine environments

were global in extent; there was no escape even for cosmopolitan species. Indeed, weak geographic

- range selectivity appears to be a general pattern with the major mass extinctions, being observed also
- 121 at the end-Triassic and the end-Cretaceous  $^{45}$  (Fig. 1a).
- The pace of the PTME extinction pattern is long debated  $^{32}$ , with contrasting hypotheses of gradual *vs*
- abrupt extinction, and single *vs* discrete extinction pulses. The gradual disappearance of marine
- species observed in several PTB successions below the main extinction horizon <sup>3,47</sup> could be
- attributed, for most groups, to the Signor-Lipps effect [G] in the fossil record whereby rarer species
- are last recorded some time before their final demise  $^{3,48,49}$ . The one exception is the ammonoid

extinction pattern observed in the succession of Iran where, considering the age confidence interval of each species, ammonoid diversity indeed shows a gradual decline before the PTME <sup>47</sup>.

The marine extinction was a geologically brief event in the latest Permian-earliest Triassic <sup>50</sup>. Well-129 studied sections from South China, such as Meishan GSSP [G], show enormous losses at the base of 130 the latest Permian Clarkina meishanensis zone <sup>3,51</sup>. Abrupt extinction in the latest Permian has also 131 been documented in Italian foraminifera and Iranian brachiopods, foraminifera, and algae <sup>48,52</sup>. Thus, 132 the crisis is often referred to as the end-Permian mass extinction, implying a single, geologically 133 instantaneous (~30 kyr) event at the end of the Permian, just before the stratigraphic PTB <sup>3,51</sup> (Fig. 2). 134 However, a significant diversity of Permian taxa, including brachiopods, foraminifers and ostracods 135 survived beyond this level to become extinct either in the final part of the Permian or in the earliest 136 Triassic <sup>53–55</sup>. Combining data from sections encompassing a spectrum of water depths shows that 137 there was an especially intense final extinction phase in South China at the base of the Isarcicella 138 *isarcica* Zone<sup>4</sup>. It is noteworthy that the second extinction pulse was proportionally intense but not as 139 large in magnitude in terms of species loss. 140

Multi-phase extinction pattern has also been reported in the Dolomites, Italy  $^{24,25}$ . Here, the main/first phase (which correlates to the first extinction pulse in South China), witnessed the loss of calcareous algae, foraminifera, and large-sized brachiopods and molluscs, with a genus extinction rate of 64%  $^{25}$ (Fig. 2). 68% of survivors and newcomers subsequently went extinct in the interval ranging from the upper *H. changxingensis* to lower *H. parvus* zones  $^{25}$ , with a second extinction pulse that is somewhat slightly earlier than the second pulse in South China 4 (Fig. 2).

Adequate sampling obviously play an important role in the assessment of the extinction pattern. When fossil occurrences are rare, statistical confidence in the precise timing and number of pulses of

extinction declines. Moreover, the importance of examining extinction patterns in different

environments is highlighted by the record of foraminifer which shows a single extinction pulse in

shallow platform facies but two episodes of extinction in deep slope facies <sup>56</sup>. In contrast, brachiopods

suffered two episodic extinctions in shallow platform  $^{57}$  and deep slope  $^{3}$  and basin facies  $^{58}$ .

<sup>153</sup> The latest U-Pb zircon ages from Meishan show that the two pulses of extinction happened at 251.941

and 251.880 Ma, respectively, separated by an interval of  $\sim 60$  kyrs <sup>59</sup> (Fig. 2). It is unclear if the

intervening interval should be considered a time of high stress or if the two pulses of extinction

represent discrete events. The interlude was certainly an intriguing time, it saw the proliferation of

microbialites and oolitic strata in low latitudes  $^{60,61}$ , whilst origination rates [G] increased <sup>4</sup>, pointing

to a temporary improvement in environmental conditions either within the extinction interval, or
 between the two main extinction pulses (Fig. 2).

Terrestrial extinction. The PTME was the Phanerozoic's largest and most severe extinction of 160 terrestrial plants and animals, at all latitudes and trophic levels (Fig. 4). Terrestrial floras suffered a 161 worldwide catastrophic die-off of many plant groups in different geographical and climate zones 162 during the PTME, which reset plant evolutionary history and was followed by an Early-Middle 163 Triassic "coal gap": an interval in which peat-forming communities disappeared <sup>10,26,62–67</sup>. Some have 164 argued that plant losses were much more moderate compared to animals <sup>68,69</sup>, but the unprecedented 165 abrupt shutdown of peat formation is a clear signal for major loss of terrestrial biomass across the 166 PTB. 167

168 Plant fossil records from South China show that diversity and abundance of the tropical rainforest-

type *Gigantopteris* flora experienced a sharp decrease with a loss of 95% of species and 50% of

genera <sup>70,71</sup>. The Permian gymnosperm-dominated floras of North China and Russia experienced

similar catastrophic losses at the same time <sup>72</sup>. In the southern hemisphere (Gondwana), the coal-

forming *Glossopteris* flora went extinct (and coals disappeared) to be replaced by seed-fern shrubs

(*Dicroidium*) <sup>10,67,73</sup>, a stratigraphically long-ranging genus that survived the PTME and migrated

polewards from low-latitudes <sup>74</sup>. The subsequent earliest Triassic floras throughout Eurasia and the

southern continents were dominated by lycopods, especially *Pleuromeia*.

During the crisis, palynological data show widespread spore abundance spikes, accompanied by high
abundances of spore tetrads and teratological [G] pollen, evidencing stressed conditions <sup>67,75–83</sup> (Fig.
Peak abundances of *Reduviasporonites* have been noted as marking fungal or algal bloom events.
The former attribution would indicate proliferation of fungal saprotrophs during terrestrial ecosystem
collapse <sup>67,84–86</sup>, but the affinity of *Reduviasporonites* and its ecological significance remain
controversial <sup>87,88</sup>.

Major changes at the base of the terrestrial food-web, for example in the structure of floral communities from luxurious forests to less productive lycophyte-dominated floras, triggered a cascade of extinction in terrestrial ecosystems at all higher trophic levels <sup>81,89</sup>. It is therefore noteworthy, but perhaps not surprising, that the mass extinction was the only one to severely affect insects, with losses of 30% of orders and 50% of families <sup>90–92</sup>.

187 Tetrapods were also severely impacted by the PTME with numerous families lost. Complex latest

188 Permian ecosystems, dominated by herbivorous pareiasaurs, dicynodonts and carnivorous

189 gorgonopsians, were replaced by ones with archosaurs and synapsids <sup>93,94</sup>. Global tetrapod generic

- data suggest there was an 89% generic loss of tetrapods near the PTB  $^{6}$ . Such losses within tetrapods
- could have happened during a "sustained extinction interval" of up to  $\sim 1$  Myr, as seen in the fossil
- record from the Karoo Basin (South Africa) <sup>95</sup> (Fig. 4), although it is difficult to determine rates in the
- low quality tetrapod record. Many niches disappeared with studies showing the loss of all small fish-
- and insect-eaters, medium and large herbivores and large carnivores in Russia <sup>94,96,97</sup>. Coupled to the
- 195 terrestrial extinction and vegetation loss, fluvial style changed across the PTME from meandering to
- <sup>196</sup> braided rivers and aeolian systems, as observed in the successions of the Karoo Basin, Russia,
- 197 Australia and North China (for example ref.  $^{98}$ ).
- The timing of terrestrial ecosystem crisis relative to extinctions in the oceans is debated. Some studies 198 argued that the terrestrial extinction was coeval with that in the oceans based on radioisotopic dating, 199 chemostratigraphy and terrestrial information recorded in marine deposits <sup>71,99,100</sup>. However, recent 200 high-resolution studies show that the terrestrial ecosystems were already stressed before the marine 201 PTME (Fig. 4). Evidence of an earlier terrestrial crisis is based on improved stratigraphic frameworks 202 including C-isotope stratigraphy (BOX 1), Hg (and Ni) spikes (BOX 2), magnetostratigraphy, and 203 high-precision dating methods <sup>26–28,95,101–103</sup> that supersede previous lower resolution studies. This 204 earlier crisis is seen in palaeofloras from the high-latitude Sydney Basin <sup>26</sup>, in the tropical peatland 205 ecosystems in equatorial South China<sup>27</sup>, in the flora and fauna of North China<sup>102</sup>, and in the tetrapod 206 losses in the high-latitude Karoo Basin<sup>28,95</sup> (Fig. 4). Recurrent wildfire and abnormal pollen in the 207 latest Permian also indicate that terrestrial ecosystems were under great stress before their collapse 208 and prior to the subsequent marine extinction <sup>26,27,78,101,102,104</sup>. 209
- It is important to note that the terrestrial fossil record primarily derives from lowland settings,
- especially lacustrine and riparian environments where much sediment accumulates. This is especially
- the case for the plant record which is dominated by plants from wetlands, due to their good
- preservational conditions in such settings <sup>105</sup>. Much less is known about plants from drier and upland
- habitats which rarely fossilize, although evidence of upland vegetation loss during the PTME has been
- <sup>215</sup> inferred from changing sedimentary facies in the Karoo Basin and Russia <sup>106</sup>. Wetland extinctions,
- that eliminated the *Glossopteris* and *Gigantopteris* mire communities, were not mirrored by equally
- severe losses in drier habitats dominated by conifers and pteridosperms <sup>107,108</sup>. This pattern may partly
- explain why the palynological record, which includes data of widely dispered pollen and spores from
- drier and upland habitats mixed with those of lowland floras, often shows a much more muted
- extinction intensity during the PTME  $^{107,108}$ .

#### 222 The trigger

The two main agents suggested to be responsible for the environmental changes that led to the PTME—which will be discussed in the next section—are extraterrestrial impact or large-scale volcanism.

Extraterrestrial impact as the trigger of the PTME was proposed on the basis of geochemical (He<sup>3</sup> in fullerenes) and sedimentological (for example, the finding of chondritic meteorite fragments in the sedimentary record) data, and of the interpretation of a large structure found in the Indian ocean, the Bedout High, as a purporter impact crater of supposed PTME age <sup>109,110</sup>. However, the extraterrestrial impact hypothesis has been largely rejected bacause data have been proven to be difficult to reproduce, and the age and interpretation of the impact structure and geochemical changes have been questioned <sup>111,112</sup>. Most scientists now agree that there is negligible evidence to support extraterrestrial impact as the cause of the PTME.

In contrast, overwhelming data support that the PTME was triggered by the eruption of the STLIP.

The STLIP was emplaced during the Permian–Triassic transition in the continental Tunguska Basin

<sup>18</sup>, the adjacent West Siberian Basin <sup>113</sup> and Taimyr Peninsula <sup>21,114</sup>, with a poorly-constrained,

original volume between 2 and 7 million  $\text{km}^{3}$  <sup>19,21,22</sup> (Fig. 5). Changes in geochemistry and mode of

emplacement of the STLIP magmas during its history, as seen in the most accessible lava pile sections

(Norilsk, Putorana and Maymecha-Kotui) and in outcrops and boreholes from the Tunguska, Taimyr

and West Siberian basins  $^{18,115-119}$ , reveal three phases of magmatic activity  $^{23}$ .

<sup>241</sup> The oldest lava flows and pyroclastic [G] deposits were alkaline [G], mafic to ultramafic, and high in

TiO<sub>2</sub> (>2 wt%) <sup>117</sup>. These magmas have a deep, pyroxenitic mantle source [G], and were rich in

<sup>243</sup> magmatic Cl <sup>119–122</sup>. The gases released by this high-volume, initial phase of magmatism were

<sup>244</sup> probably dominantly mantle-derived, products of recycled oceanic crust entrained by the mantle

plume <sup>119,122</sup>, although additional crustal sources are also likely <sup>120,121,123</sup>. This first phase of

magmatism started just before  $252.27\pm0.1$  Ma, with extensive effusive activity taking place over the

 $\sim 300$  kyr preceding the marine PTME <sup>18,23</sup>. Intriguingly these early eruptions did not produce global

changes in the  $\delta^{13}$ C record nor in Hg concentrations (Fig. 5). However, northern latitude marine

records downwind of the eruption site show pre-extinction shifts in the  $\delta^{13}$ C and Hg records  $^{124-126}$ ,

suggesting limited atmospheric mixing of volatiles released in this early eruption phase. This first

251 STLIP phase appears to have been coeval with widespread terrestrial crisis <sup>26,27</sup> (Fig. 5).

The second, tholeiitic [G] phase consisting of sills [G] and intrusions in the Tunguska Basin and

Taimyr Peninsula began at 251.907±0.067 Ma, and is coeval with the onset of the marine PTME (Fig.

5). The apparent absence of effusive and/or explosive activity during this phase is debated and may 254 reflect a lack of sampling in the region <sup>114,127–131</sup>. The tholeiitic phase magmas were derived from a 255 shallow mantle pyroxenitic-peridotitic source <sup>119,132</sup>, that underwent widespread interaction with the 256 crust <sup>132–136</sup>, and is poor in juvenile volatiles [G] <sup>137</sup>. During this subvolcanic phase the STLIP 257 intruded a succession of coal, shales, sandstones, evaporites and carbonates in the Tunguska Basin 258 <sup>125,129,130</sup> and their baking may have liberated a large amount of both greenhouse gases and 259 halocarbons <sup>123,129,130,132,138,139</sup>. Explosive basalt pipes and breccia diatremes are widespread in the 260 Tunguska Basin and are interpreted to have been the result of this gas generation and violent escape to 261 the atmosphere <sup>128,129,140,141</sup> (although at least some may have erupted later in the Triassic <sup>131</sup>). 262 Contact metamorphism of organic-carbon rich sediments around large-scaled sill intrusions in Taimyr 263 and the Tunguska Basin (Siberia) likely produced large quantities of isotopically light CO2 and CH4 264 capable of changing the C-isotope signature of the atmosphere and ocean <sup>21,125,129,138</sup>. Indeed, the 265 onset of intrusive magmatism, given analytical uncertainty, coincides with the start of the negative 266 shift in  $\delta^{13}$ C in the C. yini Zone (251.999 ±0.039 Ma; Fig. 2 and 5) <sup>59</sup>, providing indirect support for 267 this notion. 268

The third and last STLIP phase started at 251.483±0.088 Ma with renewed lava extrusion (alkaline), and ongoing intrusive activity (alkaline and tholeiitic), in the Maymecha-Kotui 118 and Taimyr regions <sup>21</sup>. These magmas are interpreted as extremely deep and hot products of a volatile-rich source <sup>142</sup>, and were likely enriched in mantle-derived CO<sub>2</sub> <sup>121</sup>. A maximum age for the end of this phase, and STLIP activity overall, is placed at 250.2±0.3 Ma <sup>18</sup>. A gradual recovery of the  $\delta^{13}$ C curve (BOX 1) towards pre-extinction levels is observed in the sedimentary record during the third phase (Fig. 5).

275

#### 276 Environmental crises

The consequences of the volcanic emissions from the STLIP are considered in this section, including the emissions produced by contact metamorphism caused by magmatic intrusions in the host rocks, mainly CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, halogens (for example, Cl, F, Br and halocarbons) and metals (for example, Hg, Cu). The multiple effects of these emissions are considered separately and are likely to have operated at different stages in the history of the PTME crisis (Fig. 6). Inferred environmental crises include global warming, oceanic anoxia, oceanic acidification, and (potentially) ozone reduction, acid rain, and metal poisoning.

*Global warming.* Among the gases released by volcanism,  $SO_2$  has the potential to trigger short-term cooling episodes over a duration only a little longer than the eruptive interval <sup>143,144</sup>. This is too short an interval to be detectable, given temporal resolution possible in deep time. Furthermore, it is a moot point whether such brief cooling intervals are capable of causing appreciable environmental stress, although episodic cooling events set in a context of longer-term warming could have damaged the ecosystems <sup>144</sup>.

Instead, global warming, due to  $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$  emissions is the clearest signal to emerge from the 290 eruption of LIPs. Temperatures across the PTB have been reconstructed using oxygen isotopes ( $\delta^{18}$ O) 291 in conodont apatite and brachiopod calcite. Conodont  $\delta^{18}$ O data from low latitude sections from Iran 292 <sup>145,146</sup>, Armenia <sup>147</sup> and South China <sup>148–152</sup>, all indicate significant low-latitudinal warming of 8–10° 293 C from the latest Permian to Early Triassic (Fig. 2 and 4). Despite differences between the analysed 294 localities due to different palaeolatitude or depositional settings, calculated sea surface temperatures 295 (SST) indicate pre-extinction (C. nodosa/C. vini Zone) SSTs of ~24-30°C that rapidly increased 296 across the PTB and into the earliest Triassic SSTs (C. isarcica Zone), ultimately peaking at ~35-39°C 297 <sup>147</sup>. Conodont  $\delta^{18}$ O records indicate that temperatures increased over an interval of ~39 kyrs <sup>147</sup>, 298 although curiously the warming slightly postdates the initial shift in carbonate  $\delta^{13}C^{147,151}$  (Fig. 2). 299

Warming of 8–10° C likely resulted in a loss of performance of many marine organisms. High 300 ambient temperatures increase metabolic activity and enhance oxygen demand, causing limited 301 functional capacity of oxygen supply culminating in hypoxemia, anaerobic metabolism and loss of 302 protein function <sup>153</sup>. Thermal tolerance of marine organisms is also linked with an organisms' level of 303 metabolic activity, deoxygenation and also oceanic acidification <sup>154,155</sup>. Thus, warming may have 304 been a major agent of the mass extinction. However, the first phase of the PTME occurred at the onset 305 of warming when conditions may still have been relatively ameable (Fig. 2), and warming may have 306 had a stronger role in the second extinction pulse in the earliest Triassic<sup>4</sup>. Lethally hot temperature 307 may have induced selective extinction of marine animals and poleward migration <sup>148,156,157</sup>. 308

However, two opposite patterns of selective extinction across latitudes had been reported <sup>156,157</sup> one showing the highest extinction rate in the high latitudes <sup>157</sup>, the other documenting the highest rate in the tropics <sup>156</sup>. This discrepancy is likely due to the different statistical schemes used. Whilst higher polar extinction has been inferred, the study only considered the end-Permian extinction pulse <sup>157</sup> whilst higher tropical extinction is calculated considering two pulses (end-Permian and earliest Triassic) <sup>156</sup>. Likewise, in the marine fossil record of South China <sup>4</sup>, the calculated extinction rate is 57% if only the first pulse is taken into account, and 93% including both pulses.

Poleward migration of about 10–15° is also observed in tetrapods <sup>148,158</sup>. In plants, elevated
 temperatures and droughts can inhibit photosynthesis, increase photooxidative stress due to higher

- <sup>318</sup> irradiance, burn leaves, and limit plants' growth and yield, and ultimately cause their death <sup>159</sup>.
- 319 Warming could have also increased the prevalence of wildfire by increasing seasonality and drought
- (Fig. 3), for example as proposed for the records of South China where high charcoal abundance is
- found in strata recording the ~60 kyrs initial decline of  $\delta^{13}$ C, up to the onset of the marine crisis
- $^{27,104,160}$  (Fig. 2). Elevated fire activity would have aided post-fire run-off and erosion  $^{104}$ .
- However, the terrestrial extinction appears to have started before the warming trend inferred from the  $\delta^{18}$ O of conodont apatite (Fig. 2 and 4). In South China, declining  $\delta^{13}$ C values coincide with high charcoal abundance <sup>27</sup> (Fig. 3) suggesting atmospheric *p*CO<sub>2</sub> was increasing during the interval of higher wildfire activity. Also, along the northwestern margin of Pangea marine environmental stress began prior to the main extinction event, suggesting that higher latitude oceans were deteriorating as the terrestrial extinction initiated <sup>125,161,162</sup>. Curiously, these changes occurred prior to the warming trend recorded by conodont  $\delta^{18}$ O data.
- Oceanic anoxia. The PTB coincides with a eustatic sea-level rise and the development of an oceanic 330 anoxic event (OAE) [G] that has been directly implicated as a cause of the crisis <sup>163</sup>. However, marine 331 anoxia during transgression is often encountered in the geological record, raising the question of why 332 these conditions caused such a severe extinction crisis? There are likely to have been three reasons: 333 the anoxia extended in some regions into extremely shallow waters <sup>164</sup>, although oxic refugia 334 remained <sup>165</sup>; the Panthalassa superocean also become anoxic throughout much of the water column 335 <sup>111,166</sup>; the OAE persisted, with varying intensities, for several million years into the Middle Triassic, 336 prolonging the stressful conditions for marine life <sup>167–169</sup>. Thus, both the extent and duration of anoxia 337 were exceptional by Phanerozoic standards. 338
- Evidence for anoxia is diverse and found in a broad range of environments. Organic-rich, pyritic, 339 black shales, the typical manifestation of anoxic deposition, are best developed in the deep ocean 340 sections now found in the accreted terranes in Japan and New Zealand <sup>111,166,170</sup>. Black shales are less 341 common in shelf and epicontinental seaways, especially in tropical settings, perhaps due to high 342 organic matter remineralization rates in hot sea water. In the low-latitude carbonate setting of Tethys, 343 anoxic facies are usually developed as laminated, pyritic micrites such as in northern Italy <sup>50</sup>. In 344 northern Boreal shelf seas, anoxic facies include finely-laminated, argillaceous strata and pyritic 345 sandstones with abundant framboidal pyrite [G]<sup>161,164</sup>. 346
- Intensity of marine anoxia and its extent are inferred from geochemical data. The uranium isotope ratio of  $^{238}$ U/ $^{235}$ U recorded in limestones shows a shift to lower values immediately prior to the first phase of mass extinction (Fig. 2): a change attributed to the accelerated removal of  $^{238}$ U in anoxic

- 350 bottom waters 171. The degree of anoxia driven metal drawdown was such that the oceans become
- depleted in trace metals <sup>172</sup>. The scale of anoxia also affected the ocean's sulphate budget.
- <sup>352</sup> Increasingly heavy sulphate-sulphur isotope values in the Early Triassic, relates to removal of
- isotopically light pyrite sulphur, suggesting reduced seawater sulphate concentrations <sup>173</sup>. Biomarkers
- also provide evidence for oxygen-poor conditions including the presence of isorenieratane, an
- indicator that anoxic conditions extended into the photic zone  $^{174}$ .
- The development of intensive anoxia profoundly altered the oceans' nutrient structure. Phosphorus 356 recycling enhances under anoxic conditions <sup>175</sup> and, when combined with higher continental runoff, 357 this leads to high phosphorus availability in the water column. However, nitrogen rather than 358 phosphorus was more likely the limiting nutrient in the anoxic oceans of the time<sup>176,177</sup>. Thus, nitrogen isotope ratios show a significant decrease, from values up to  $\sim 10\%$  to  $\sim 0\%$ , in most of the 360 basins across the PTB<sup>177,178</sup>. This suggests strong denitrification accompanied the onset of global 361 anoxia, likely due to a fundamental shift from a nitrate-dominated to an ammonium-dominated 362 nutrient supply which would normally favour nitrogen-fixing diazotrophs. However, diazotrophs 363 require molybdenum and iron for nitrogen fixation and yet these are efficiently removed from anoxic 364 waters, thereby causing a decrease in the ocean's total fixed-nitrogen and low levels of productivity 365 <sup>176</sup>. Some alternative scenarios favour productivity increase during the extinction interval, driven by 366 enhanced nutrient run-off<sup>179</sup>, but these fail to account for the micronutrient limitations of diazotrophs 367 in euxinic waters, as well as the absence of organic-rich shales in the Early Triassic <sup>180</sup>. 368
- The ultimate cause of the Permian-Triassic OAE has long been attributed to the effects of STLIP with 369 warming and more sluggish ocean circulation usually invoked <sup>111,163</sup>. The Community Earth System 370 Model with its embedded biogeochemical cycles, shows that an 11°C sea-surface temperature rise (a 371 realistic value supported by  $\delta^{18}$ O evidence <sup>148</sup>; Fig. 2 and 5), combined with increased freshwater 372 runoff into high latitude seas, greatly increases ocean stratification and decreases meridional overturn 373 circulation <sup>157</sup>. The result is a dramatic decrease in seafloor oxygenation. The model also successfully 374 replicates regional variations with the best ventilated area shown to be the Perigondwanan margin of 375 southern Tethys <sup>157</sup>, a finding that closely matches field evidence from this region <sup>54</sup>. 376
- 377 *Oceanic acidification.* Another potentially harmful effect of massive CO<sub>2</sub> injection into the 378 atmosphere–ocean system is oceanic acidification (Fig. 6). Huge amounts of CO<sub>2</sub> entering the oceans 379 acidifies water and decreases carbonate saturation. Evidence for oceanic acidification at the PTB 380 comes from boron isotope ( $\delta^{11}$ B) and calcium isotope ( $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca) records <sup>43,181,182</sup> (Fig. 2), and the 381 sediment record <sup>43,162,183</sup>. However, data from  $\delta^{11}$ B of bulk carbonates, used to signify acidification 382 during the second phase of the PTME during the *I. isarcica* Zone <sup>184</sup>, are now generally considered

not to actually reflect marine pH <sup>185</sup>. Instead, a composite  $\delta^{11}$ B record from pristine brachiopod shells 383 from the Southern Alps (Italy) and South China shows a decline in  $\delta^{11}$ B values, which suggests 384 lowering of seawater pH, between the onset of the negative C-isotope excursion and the base of the 385 *parvus* Zone, just above the PTB <sup>182</sup> (Fig. 2). This composite  $\delta^{11}$ B record needs, however, further 386 validation in other sections and improvement of temporal resolution. Ooidal limestones are 387 widespread during the inferred lower pH interval <sup>25</sup>, indicating saturated conditions, and the analysed 388 brachiopods come from interbedded levels of microbialites <sup>182</sup>. The prevailing carbonates suggest that 389 under saturation was not achieved. Acidification could have happened in very brief pulses, which are 390 not recorded by low-resolution datasets, rather as a relatively longer event between the onset of the 391 marine extinction and the earliest Triassic <sup>182</sup>. 392

<sup>393</sup> A negative  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca shift during the PTME interval has been linked to the injection of CO<sub>2</sub> from the

394 STLIP activity on the basis of its stratigraphic correlation with the negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion <sup>186</sup>.

Instead of solely indicating oceanic acidification, Ca-isotope data modelling suggests that a complex scenario controlled seawater  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca changes, involving CO<sub>2</sub> release, acidification, reduced skeletal carbonate sink, enhanced weathering of shelf carbonates, changes in carbonate mineralogy and changes in seawater saturation state <sup>187,188</sup>. In detail though, the negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion (in bed 24 at Meishan) predates the negative  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca shift (which occurs above bed 25 <sup>186</sup>; Fig. 2), complicating the interpretation of the relationships between the Ca- and C-isotope records. Similar negative  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursions, recorded by both conodont apatite and bulk carbonate, are seen at the same stratigraphic

interval in other localities  $^{188-191}$ .

<sup>403</sup> More indirect evidence for oceanic acidification comes from the fossil record which shows that the

404 crisis saw the preferential extinction of physiologically unbuffered taxa, with low metabolisms and

<sup>405</sup> high energy demand for the production of calcium carbonate skeletons (for example corals,

brachiopods, calcareous sponges, and foraminifera), whilst well-buffered taxa (for example bivalves,

407 gastropods, ammonoids and conodonts) could have survived the crisis relatively better 4,43,192.

Analysis of the microstructure of brachiopod shells provides evidence to suggest a role for
acidification in brachiopod extinction losses. All brachiopod groups suffered severe losses with the
diverse Strophomenata going extinct. The Rhynchonellata fared somewhat better and it has been
suggested that their higher shell organic content enabled them to better survive acidified conditions
<sup>183</sup>. However, at lower taxonomic order the Rhynchonellata suffered severe losses and their story
during the PTME could also be described as a successful re-radiation of the survivors in the earliest

<sup>414</sup> Triassic that saw some genera become widespread <sup>193</sup>. In addition, the preferential extinction of

coarsely ornamented ammonoids supports the pressure of oceanic acidification on shell-building costs
 for shelled animals <sup>194</sup>.

Along the north western margin of Pangea there is also a gradual loss of carbonate producers through

the late Permian creating an empty ecologic niche that was filled by siliceous sponges expanding from

deep environments to become the dominant organism in late Permian shallow shelfs  $^{161,162}$ ,

suggesting decreasing pH prior to the extinction.

*Ozone disruption.* High abundance of teratological sporomorphs during the PTME (Fig. 4) has been attributed to increased UV-B radiation due to disruption of the ozone layer <sup>76,78,81,195</sup>. Experiments on living *Pinus mugo* showed increasing exposure of plants to UV-B radiation induced malformation on pollen grains similar to those observed at the PTME and, although all trees survived, their fertility markedly decreased <sup>81</sup>. Therefore, higher UV-B radiation and lower plant fertility may have triggered a collapse of the whole terrestrial ecosystem by shutting down most primary productivity.

<sup>427</sup> Ozone depletion could have been driven by the release of halogens and halocarbon compounds from

volcanic activity and the combustion of coals and evaporites intruded by STLIP <sup>196–198</sup> (Fig. 5).

However, the first explosive phase of STLIP activity appears to be coincident with the early terrestrial

decline of plants and the first occurrences of teratological sporomorphs (Fig. 4), whilst the release of

halocarbons (for example CH<sub>3</sub>Cl) from contact metamorphism (intrusive phase) is thought to have the

432 strongest impact on the ozone layer <sup>197,198</sup>. Teratological sporomorphs are found throughout the

PTME (Fig. 4), but ozone is quickly (~10 yrs) restored in the atmosphere, hence making a long-term

disruption of the global ozone unlikely <sup>198</sup>.

Asian Acid rain. Teratological sporomorphs (Fig. 4) alone are not a direct evidence of UV-B radiation, as

they could be the result of other stresses such as acid rain  $^{81,198}$  and metal poisoning  $^{82}$ . Acid

deposition can potentially kill plants, phytoplankton, vertebrates and invertebrates in terrestrial

<sup>438</sup> aquatic ecosystems, and acidification of non-calcareous soil results in leaching of important nutrients

(Ca, Mg and K), with the effect of weakening plants and increasing their mortality rate <sup>199</sup>.

Magmatic degassing of  $SO_2$  and halogens from STLIP could have driven acid rain <sup>198</sup>. Earth system

441 modelling shows that, alongside the previously discussed ozone damage, S injected into the

stratosphere during STLIP pyroclastic activity (Fig. 5) could have triggered extensive acid rains at the

<sup>443</sup> PTB, although these were only severe (pH = 2) in the Northern Hemisphere <sup>198</sup>.

Possible direct evidence of acid rain comes from one section in northern Italy, where the abundance of
 vanillin—a product of pH-dependent enzymatic decomposition of organic matter in soil—could

suggest pulses of soil acidification <sup>200</sup>. Vanillin peaks occur before the marine extinction interval
(latest Permian) <sup>25</sup>. Hence, acid rains may have affected terrestrial ecosystems already before the
onset of the marine extinction (Fig. 5). Significantly, PTB palaeosols in Antarctica show high

chemical weathering but no indication of acid conditions; there was no leaching of Ca and Mg  $^{201}$ .

450 Other geochemical evidence for acid rain comes from sulfur isotope and concentration records in the

Karoo Basin (South Africa), where higher accumulation of sulfide was interpreted as the effect of

452 high sulfate supply to the freshwater environment from acid rain <sup>202</sup>. However, the terrestrial

extinction in the Karoo Basin began before the S geochemical changes, making their significance

<sup>454</sup> moot. Currently, exept for these local datasets, there is no conclusive evidence that widespread acid

rain triggered the terrestrial collapse in the latest Permian, especially not in the southern hemisphere.

*Metal poisoning.* Potentially, metal poisoning may have occurred in marine environments, where an increase of concentration of toxic metals (Hg, Cr, As, and Co) is observed <sup>125,126,161</sup>. High concentrations of Hg, the most toxic metal, may have been reached after the marine extinction, when the reduction of bioproductivity could have led to a decrease of Hg drawdown by organic matter and its potential build-up in marine environments to toxic levels, before it was removed by sulphide deposition <sup>126</sup>.

A coincidence between a peak of teratological lycophyte spore tetrads [G] and high Hg and Cu 462 concentrations has been found a short distance above the terrestrial extinction level in South China, 463 indicating that the survivor plants might have experienced stress caused by higher metal 464 concentrations in the environment <sup>82</sup> (Fig. 4). Reduced plant transpiration, changes to the hydrological 465 cycle and climatic drying following terrestrial vegetation loss may have resulted in reduced water 466 availability in freshwater ecosystems leading to such metal concentrations increase. Hg is generally 467 thought to derive from volcanic activity <sup>203</sup>, but Hg isotopes and modelling of Hg cycling indicate 468 that, superimposed on a general increase of volcanic Hg deposition across the PTME, further Hg 469 could have been released into the environment due to massive oxidation of terrestrial organic matter 470 and soil following the collapse of land ecosystems <sup>204</sup> (BOX 2). Similar behaviour could have sourced 471 Cu<sup>82</sup>. Hence, the increase of metal loading in South China during the PTME might actually be the 472 consequence of the demise of the Gigantopteris rainforests and wetland species <sup>204</sup>. 473

474

#### 475 Linking kill mechanisms and extinction patterns

- <sup>476</sup> The latest high-resolution chronology of the PTME (Fig. 6) suggests that the terrestrial ecological
- disturbance could have started 60–370 kyr before the marine extinction  $^{26-28,95,101-103}$ . This was
- coincidental with the initial, mostly explosive phase of STLIP. However, the temporal resolution of
- the terrestrial extinctions remains more poorly known than that of the marine extinctions and may
- 480 have been spread over  $\sim 1$  Myr  $^{95}$ .

The terrestrial extinction mechanism is not clear, and mainly inferred by indirect, often local, and mainly palaeontological proxies (Fig. 6). Increased seasonality during the initial stage of the negative  $\delta^{13}$ C (Fig. 6) could have lead to increase of wildfires <sup>27</sup>. Declining  $\delta^{13}$ C values coeval with higher charcoal abundance suggest addition of isotopically light CO<sub>2</sub> to the ocean–atmosphere system and that warming may have played a role. However, the available temperature proxy from marine settings (conodont  $\delta^{18}$ O) suggests temperatures did not begin to increase until after the terrestrial crisis had begun (Fig. 2 and 5).

Temporal decoupling of terrestrial extinctions predating marine extinctions is intriguing and suggests spatial heterogeneity in the extinction patterns and potentially mechanisms. Delayed onset of marine extinctions may be partially related to thermal inertia of the oceans and their higher thermal capacity compared to land that heats and cools quicker <sup>205</sup>, but ocean turnover times occur in the order of 1000 years <sup>206</sup> so are unlikely to have operated at a 60–370 kyrs time scale.

- Terrestrial stress may have come from emissions of  $SO_2$  and halogens and their consequent acid rains
- $^{202}$ , and disrupted ozone shield  $^{76,81}$ . Increasing UV-B radiation on Earth's surface and acid
- depositions could have had lethal effects on terrestrial ecosystems, causing stress to the vegetation,
- lowering plants' fertility and eventually leading to their death, with repercussions at all higher trophic
- <sup>497</sup> levels. However, long-term disruption of the global ozone during the PTME is unlikely <sup>198</sup>.
- It is not clear what was the effect on marine ecosystems of the first phase of the STLIP activity (Fig. 6). Beds of coal ash and associated Hg spikes are observed in northwest Pangea prior to the main negative  $\delta^{13}$ C excursion as well as Ni isotope anomalies that may record this initial phase of eruptions impacting the terrestrial environment <sup>125</sup>. This region also shows early marine stress <sup>161,162</sup>, while more equitorial records show no marine impacts.
- The marine extinction interval has a clear, temporal link with the second mostly intrusive phase of the STLIP and gas emissions, and persisted for <100 kyrs straddling the PTB. There were two pulses of extinction intensity at the beginning and end of this interval although significant losses were also occurring in the interlude interval too.

Taxonomic, morphologic, and ecologic selectivity (Fig. 3) and the magnitude of marine extinction 507 suggest that a combination of global warming, anoxia, and oceanic acidification best explains the 508 marine PTME (Fig. 6). Groups intolerant to hypoxia and high temperature were preferentially 509 eliminated during the PTME, suggesting that these stressors played an important role in the extinction 510 of marine animals <sup>157,207</sup> (Fig. 3). Physiologically buffered taxa experienced lower extinction rates 511 than unbuffered taxa <sup>42-44</sup> (Fig. 3). Oceanic acidification could have been an important stressor for 512 shelled animals <sup>43</sup>, as also supported by the preferential extinction of coarsely ornamented ammonoids 513 <sup>194</sup> (Fig. 3). Survival animals migrated to higher latitudes or deep seawaters, possibly to escape the 514 hot temperature in equatorial regions or surface seawaters  $^{56,148,156}$  (Fig. 6). 515

516

#### 517 Summary and future directions

The link between the PTME and the eruption of the STLIP has been well established since the late 518 1990s 17. Dramatically improved absolute dating has strengthened the link to the point where 519 scenarios involving distinct stages of the emplacement history can be linked with consequent 520 environmental changes (Fig. 6). The effects of the eruptions were likely experienced first in terrestrial 521 settings, where plant productivity crashed and coal ceased to form, and in high-latitudes marine 522 settings in the northern hemisphere. The initial explosive phase of the STLIP emplacement may have 523 driven this crisis, inlcuding increased seasonality, ozone depletion, with higher UV-B radiation, and 524 acid rain. 525

The marine mass extinction is coeval with the mainly intrusive phase of the STLIP. Increasing fossil and geochemical data resolution indicates that the marine mass extinction could have happened either in two distinct pulses or gradually within an interval straddling the PTB. The thermogenic gases produced by the interaction of magma with the intruded sediments introduced into the PTB atmosphere–ocean system triggered a rapid temperature rise, a decline in ocean ventilation, and ocean acidification, which led to the mass extinction. However, despite the large amount of available data and significantly improved gochronology, the reconstruction of the complex co-occurring phenomena interlinked in the fatal cascade that drove the PTME remains difficult.

534 Future research direction should aim at improving the spatial and temporal resolution of datasets from

<sup>535</sup> PTME terrestrial records. High-precision U-Pb dating of ash beds and detrital zircons, together with

magnetostratigraphy and chemostratigraphy, will increase the chronological constraints of the

<sup>537</sup> terrestrial crisis, clarifying the delay between the beginning of the extinction on land and in the ocean.

Improved spatial coverage of high-precision stratigraphic syntheses will further evaluate extinctionpattern heterogeneity.

540 Detailed evaluation of PTME palynological assemblages will give a more comprehensive picture of 541 through-ranging taxa to understand dynamics and composition of upland "refugial" or survivor floras. 542 The occurrence of teratologies in sporomorphs must be studied in different plants groups, at different 543 latitudes and throughout the PTME, to identify their ultimate cause and understand whether it 544 interested worlwide flora, and at which stages of the event. Further S-isotope and biomarker analysis 545 of PTME terrestrial successions could strengthen the evidence of acid rains during the terrestrial 546 extinction interval.

The temporal relationship between warming and extinction, both on land and on the ocean, remains

problematic, and further studies, including modelling, should try to understand the apparent lags

between the C-isotope, O-isotope, and fossil records. Future high-resolution studies ( $\delta^{18}$ O from

550 conodont apatite or brachiopod shells) will be pivotal in detecting brief temperature changes on the

already manifest long-term CO<sub>2</sub>-driven warming trend. However, the current limitation is not the

552 precision of  $\delta^{18}$ O analysis but sample availablity. Higher resolution can only be achieved by

- decreasing the size of conodont samples taken in the field followed by SIMS analyses of individual
- 554 conodont elements.

Further ecological and physiological studies are required to link environmental changes and extinction patterns. Quantitative predictions for extinction selectivity under different changing environmental conditions are needed to distinguish among potential killing stressors. More consistent geochemical  $(\delta^{11}B)$  and palaeontological records of ocean saturation are necessary to properly investigate the role of ocean acidification.

Furthermore, future endeavours from the geochronology community should be focused on shedding 560 more light on the temporal correlations between the intrusive and effusive realms of the STLIP, which 561 are still weak. Moreover, since most of the STLIP deposits are covered, it is difficult to fully assess 562 the true nature of the eruption history. Drilling programs could significantly expand the knowledge on 563 the history of the STLIP emplacement. The voluminous tephra deposits and the explosive pipes are 564 tangible proof of explosive activity of the STLIP and of gas discharge to the atmosphere. Clarifying 565 the origin and timing of emplacement of these products and structures would contribute greatly to 566 understanding the link between STLIP emplacement stages and global environmental changes. 567

Perhaps the most overriding question from the study of mass extinctions driven by volcanic
emissions, of which the PTME is the key example, is what can it tells us about future climate trends.
Clearly, extreme global warming can lead to severe consequences for the life but if these effects lie

- tens of thousands of years in the future, then they are of no geopolitical concern. If changes occur
- over decades or centuries then their significance increases. Despite the great advances in resolving the
- details of the PTME, future studies of the crisis should attempt to decipher rates of change on 100–
- <sup>574</sup> 1000 year scale.
- 575
- 576 **References**
- 577
- 578
   1.
   Wignall, P. B. *The Worst of Times*. (Princeton University Press, 2015).
   doi:10.1515/9781400874248.
- Song, H. *et al.* Thresholds of temperature change for mass extinctions. *Nature Communications* 12, 4694 (2021).
- Jin, Y. G. *et al.* Pattern of marine mass extinction near the Permian-Triassic boundary
   in South China. *Science* 289, 432–436 (2000).
- 4. Song, H., Wignall, P. B., Tong, J. & Yin, H. Two pulses of extinction during the Permian-Triassic crisis. *Nature Geoscience* **6**, 52–56 (2013).
- 5. Stanley, S. M. Estimates of the magnitudes of major marine mass extinctions in earth
   history. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 113, E6325–E6334 (2016).
- Benton, M. J. & Newell, A. J. Impacts of global warming on Permo-Triassic terrestrial
   ecosystems. *Gondwana Research* 25, 1308–1337 (2014).
- Brayard, A. *et al.* Transient metazoan reefs in the aftermath of the end-Permian mass
   extinction. *Nature Geoscience* 4, 693–697 (2011).
- 8. Brayard, A. *et al.* Good genes and good luck: Ammonoid diversity and the endpermian mass extinction. *Science* **325**, 1118–1121 (2009).
- Scheyer, T. M., Romano, C., Jenks, J. & Bucher, H. Early triassic marine biotic
   recovery: The predators' perspective. *PLoS ONE* vol. 9 e88987 (2014).
- Retallack, G. J., Veevers, J. J. & Morante, R. Global coal gap between Permian Triassic extinction and Middle Triassic recovery of peat-forming plants. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 108, 195–207 (1996).
- <sup>600</sup> 11. Payne, J. L. *et al.* Large perturbations of the carbon cycle during recovery from the <sup>601</sup> end-Permian extinction. *Science* **305**, 506–509 (2004).
- Song, H., Wignall, P. B. & Dunhill, A. M. Decoupled taxonomic and ecological
   recoveries from the Permo-Triassic extinction. *Science Advances* 4, eaat5091 (2018).
- Retallack, G. J. Postapocalyptic greenhouse paleoclimate revealed by earliest Triassic
   paleosols in the Sydney Basin, Australia. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 111, 52–70 (1999).
- Ward, P. D., Montgomery, D. R. & Smith, R. Altered river morphology in South
   Africa related to the Permian-Triassic extinction. *Science* 289, 1740–1743 (2000).
- Wignall, P. B. & Twitchett, R. J. Extent, duration, and nature of the Permian-Triassic
   superanoxic event. Special Paper of the Geological Society of America 356, 395–413
   (2002).
- Rampino, M. R. & Stothers, R. B. Flood basalt volcanism during the past 250 million
   *Science* 241, 663–668 (1988).
- Renne, P. R. & Basu, A. R. Rapid eruption of the Siberian traps flood basalts at the
   permo-triassic boundary. *Science* 253, 176–179 (1991).

18. Burgess, S. D. & Bowring, S. A. High-precision geochronology confirms voluminous 616 magmatism before, during, and after Earth's most severe extinction. Science Advances 617 1, e1500470 (2015). 618 19. Vasiljev, Y. R., Zolotukhin, V. V., Feoktistov, G. D. & Prusskava, S. N. Volume 619 estimation and genesis of Permian-Triassic trap magmatism from Siberian platform. 620 Russian Geology and Geophysics 41, 1696–1705 (2000). 621 20. Dobretsov, N. L. Large igneous provinces of Asia (250 Ma): Siberian and Emeishan 622 traps (plateau basalts) and associated granitoids. Geologiva i Geofizika 46, 870-890 623 (2005). 624 21. Augland, L. E. et al. The main pulse of the Siberian Traps expanded in size and 625 composition. Scientific Reports 9, 18723 (2019). 626 22. Kasbohm, J., Schoene, B. & Burgess, S. Radiometric Constraints on the Timing, 627 Tempo, and Effects of Large Igneous Province Emplacement. in Large Igneous 628 *Provinces: A Driver of Global Environmental and Biotic Changes* 27–82 (2021). doi:10.1002/9781119507444.ch2. Burgess, S. D., Muirhead, J. D. & Bowring, S. A. Initial pulse of Siberian Traps sills 23. 631 as the trigger of the end-Permian mass extinction. Nature Communications 8, 164 632 (2017).633 24. Posenato, R. Marine biotic events in the lopingian succession and latest Permian 634 extinction in the Southern Alps (Italy). Geological Journal 45, 195-215 (2010). 635 Posenato, R. The end-Permian mass extinction (EPME) and the early triassic biotic 25. 636 recovery in the western Dolomites (Italy): state of the art. Bollettino della Societa 637 Paleontologica Italiana 58, 11–34 (2019). 638 Fielding, C. R. et al. Age and pattern of the southern high-latitude continental end-26. 639 Permian extinction constrained by multiproxy analysis. Nature Communications 10, 640 385 (2019). 641 27. Chu, D. et al. Ecological disturbance in tropical peatlands prior to marine Permian-642 Triassic mass extinction. Geology 48, 288–292 (2020). 643 28. Gastaldo, R. A. et al. The base of the Lystrosaurus Assemblage Zone, Karoo Basin, 644 predates the end-Permian marine extinction. Nature Communications 11, 1428 (2020). 645 29. Foote, M. Morphological and taxonomic diversity in clade's history: the blastoid 646 record and stochastic simulations. Contributions From the Museum of Paleontology 647 28, 101–140 (1991). 648 Stanley, S. M. & Yang, X. A double mass extinction at the end of the paleozoic era. 30. 649 Science 266, 1340–1344 (1994). 31. Wang, X. D. & Sugiyama, T. Diversity and extinction patterns of Permian coral faunas 651 of China. Lethaia 33, 285-294 (2000). 652 Hallam, A. & Wignall, P. B. Mass Extinctions and their Aftermath. (Oxford University 32. Press, 1997). 654 33. Orchard, M. J. Conodont diversity and evolution through the latest Permian and Early 655 Triassic upheavals. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 252, 93-117 656 (2007).657 Romano, C. et al. Permian-Triassic Osteichthyes (bony fishes): Diversity dynamics 34. 658 and body size evolution. Biological Reviews 91, 106-147 (2016). 659 35. Tu, C., Chen, Z. Q. & Harper, D. A. T. Permian-Triassic evolution of the Bivalvia: 660 Extinction-recovery patterns linked to ecologic and taxonomic selectivity. 661 Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 459, 53-62 (2016). 662 36. Schaal, E. K., Clapham, M. E., Rego, B. L., Wang, S. C. & Payne, J. L. Comparative 663 size evolution of marine clades from the Late Permian through Middle Triassic. 664 Paleobiology 42, 127–142 (2016). 665

- 37. Chen, J. *et al.* Size variation of brachiopods from the Late Permian through the Middle
  Triassic in South China: Evidence for the Lilliput Effect following the PermianTriassic extinction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 519, 248–
  257 (2019).
- Feng, Y., Song, H. & Bond, D. P. G. Size variations in foraminifers from the early
  Permian to the Late Triassic: Implications for the Guadalupian-Lopingian and the
  Permian-Triassic mass extinctions. *Paleobiology* 46, 511–532 (2020).
- 39. Luo, G., Lai, X., Jiang, H. & Zhang, K. Size variation of the end Permian conodont
  Neogondolella at Meishan Section, Changxing, Zhejiang and its significance. *Science in China, Series D: Earth Sciences* 49, 337–347 (2006).
- Brayard, A. *et al.* Early Triassic Gulliver gastropods: Spatio-temporal distribution and significance for biotic recovery after the end-Permian mass extinction. *Earth-Science Reviews* vol. 146 31–64 (2015).
- 41. Knoll, A. H., Bambach, R. K., Canfield, D. E. & Grotzinger, J. P. Comparative earth history and late Permian mass extinction. *Science* vol. 273 452–457 (1996).
- 42. Knoll, A. H., Bambach, R. K., Payne, J. L., Pruss, S. & Fischer, W. W.
  Paleophysiology and end-Permian mass extinction. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 256, 295–313 (2007).
- Clapham, M. E. & Payne, J. L. Acidification, anoxia, and extinction: A multiple
  logistic regression analysis of extinction selectivity during the Middle and Late
  Permian. *Geology* 39, 1059–1062 (2011).
- 44. Vázquez, P. & Clapham, M. E. Extinction selectivity among marine fishes during
   multistressor global change in the end-Permian and end-Triassic crises. *Geology* 45, 395–398 (2017).
- 45. Payne, J. L. & Finnegan, S. The effect of geographic range on extinction risk during
   background and mass extinction. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 104, 10506–10511 (2007).
- 46. Dai, X. & Song, H. Toward an understanding of cosmopolitanism in deep time: A case
   study of ammonoids from the middle Permian to the Middle Triassic. *Paleobiology* 46,
   533–549 (2020).
- 47. Kiessling, W. *et al.* Pre-mass extinction decline of latest Permian ammonoids. *Geology* 46, 283–286 (2018).
- 48. Rampino, M. R. & Adler, A. C. Evidence for abrupt latest Permian mass extinction of foraminifera: results of tests for the Signor-Lipps effect. *Geology* 26, 415–418 (1998).
- 49. Song, H., Tong, J., Chen, Z. Q., Yang, H. & Wang, Y. End-Permian mass extinction of foraminifers in the Nanpanjiang basin, South China. *Journal of Paleontology* 83, 718– 738 (2009).
- 50. Wignall, P. B. & Hallam, A. Anoxia as a cause of the Permian/Triassic mass
   extinction: facies evidence from northern Italy and the western United States.
   *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 93, 21–46 (1992).
- 51. Shen, S. Z. *et al.* A sudden end-Permian mass extinction in South China. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 131, 205–223 (2019).
- 52. Angiolini, L., Checconi, A., Gaetani, M. & Rettori, R. The latest Permian mass
  extinction in the Alborz Mountains (North Iran). *Geological Journal* 45, 216–229
  (2010).
- 53. Yin, H., Feng, Q., Lai, X., Baud, A. & Tong, J. The protracted Permo-Triassic crisis and multi-episode extinction around the Permian-Triassic boundary. *Global and Planetary Change* 55, 1–20 (2007).

- 54. Wignall, P. B. & Newton, R. Contrasting deep-water records from the Upper Permian 714 and Lower Triassic of South Tibet and British Columbia: Evidence for a diachronous 715 mass extinction. Palaios 18, 153-167 (2003). Wang, Y. et al. Quantifying the process and abruptness of the end-Permian mass 55. 717 extinction. Paleobiology 40, 113-129 (2014). 718 Liu, X., Song, H., Bond, D. P. G., Tong, J. & Benton, M. J. Migration controls 56. 719 extinction and survival patterns of foraminifers during the Permian-Triassic crisis in 720 South China. Earth-Science Reviews vol. 209 103329 (2020). 721 57. Chen, Z. Q. et al. Environmental and biotic turnover across the Permian-Triassic 722 boundary on a shallow carbonate platform in western Zhejiang, South China. 723 Australian Journal of Earth Sciences 56, 775–797 (2009). 724 He, W. H. et al. Late Permian marine ecosystem collapse began in deeper waters: 58. 725 Evidence from brachiopod diversity and body size changes. Geobiology 13, 123–138 726 (2015). 727 59. Burgess, S. D., Bowring, S. & Shen, S. Z. High-precision timeline for Earth's most 728 severe extinction. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 111, 3316–3321 (2014). 730 Yang, H. et al. Composition and structure of microbialite ecosystems following the 60. 731 end-Permian mass extinction in South China. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 308, 111–128 (2011). 733 Tian, L. et al. Distribution and size variation of ooids in the aftermath of the permian-61. 734 triassic mass extinction. Palaios 30, 714-727 (2015). 62. Retallack, G. J. Permian-triassic life crisis on land. Science 267, 77-80 (1995). 736 Looy, C. V., Brugman, W. A., Dilcher, D. L. & Visscher, H. The delayed resurgence 63. 737 of equatorial forests after the Permian-Triassic ecologic crisis. Proceedings of the 738 National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 96, 13857–13862 (1999). 740 Hermann, E. et al. Terrestrial ecosystems on North Gondwana following the end-64. 741 Permian mass extinction. Gondwana Research 20, 630-637 (2011). 742 Cascales-Miñana, B., Diez, J. B., Gerrienne, P. & Cleal, C. J. A palaeobotanical 65. 743 perspective on the great end-Permian biotic crisis. Historical Biology 28, 1066-1074 744
- (2016).
  66. Yu, J. *et al.* Vegetation changeover across the Permian-Triassic Boundary in
  Southwest China. Extinction, survival, recovery and palaeoclimate: A critical review. *Earth-Science Reviews* vol. 149 203–224 (2015).
- King Science Reviews (on 11) 205 22 ((2010)).
  67. Vajda, V. *et al.* End-Permian (252 Mya) deforestation, wildfires and flooding—An ancient biotic crisis with lessons for the present. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 529, 115875 (2020).
- 68. Schneebeli-Hermann, E., Hochuli, P. A. & Bucher, H. Palynofloral associations before and after the Permian–Triassic mass extinction, Kap Stosch, East Greenland. *Global and Planetary Change* 155, 178–195 (2017).
- Nowak, H., Schneebeli-Hermann, E. & Kustatscher, E. No mass extinction for land
   plants at the Permian–Triassic transition. *Nature Communications* 10, 384 (2019).
- 757 70. Chu, D. *et al.* Biostratigraphic correlation and mass extinction during the Permian 758 Triassic transition in terrestrial-marine siliciclastic settings of South China. *Global and* 759 *Planetary Change* 146, 67–88 (2016).
- 760 71. Zhang, H. *et al.* The terrestrial end-Permian mass extinction in South China.
   761 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 448, 108–124 (2016).

762	72.	Krassilov, V. & Karasev, E. Paleofloristic evidence of climate change near and beyond
763		the Permian-Triassic boundary. <i>Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology</i>
764		<b>284</b> , 326–336 (2009).
765	73.	Mcloughlin, S., Lindström, S. & Drinnan, A. N. Gondwanan floristic and
766		sedimentological trends during the Permian-Triassic transition: New evidence from the
767		Amery Group, northern Prince Charles Mountains, East Antarctica. Antarctic Science
768		9, 281–298 (1997).
769	74.	Kerp, H., Hamad, A. A., Vörding, B. & Bandel, K. Typical Triassic Gondwanan floral
770		elements in the Upper Permian of the paleotropics. Geology 34, 265–268 (2006).
771	75.	Eshet, Y., Rampino, M. R. & Visscher, H. Fungal event and palynological record of
772		ecological crisis and recovery across the Permian-Triassic boundary. Geology 23, 967-
773		970 (1995).
774	76.	Visscher, H. et al. Environmental mutagenesis during the end-Permian ecological
775		crisis. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of
776		America 101, 12952–12956 (2004).
777	77.	Looy, C. V., Collinson, M. E., Van Konijnenburg-Van Cittert, J. H. A., Visscher, H. &
778		Brain, A. P. R. The ultrastructure and botanical affinity of end-permian spore tetrads.
779		International Journal of Plant Sciences 166, 875–887 (2005).
780	78.	Foster, C. B. & Afonin, S. A. Abnormal pollen grains: An outcome of deteriorating
781		atmospheric conditions around the Permian-Triassic boundary. Journal of the
782		Geological Society 162, 653–659 (2005).
783	79.	Hochuli, P. A., Schneebeli-Hermann, E., Mangerud, G. & Bucher, H. Evidence for
784		atmospheric pollution across the Permian-Triassic transition. Geology 45, 1123–1126
785		(2017).
786	80.	Rampino, M. R. & Eshet, Y. The fungal and acritarch events as time markers for the
787		latest Permian mass extinction: An update. Geoscience Frontiers 9, 147–154 (2018).
788	81.	Benca, J. P., Duijnstee, I. A. P. & Looy, C. V. UV-B-induced forest sterility:
789		Implications of ozone shield failure in earth's largest extinction. Science Advances 4,
790		(2018).
791	82.	Chu, D. et al. Metal-induced stress in survivor plants following the end-Permian
792		collapse of land ecosystems. Geology 49, 657–661 (2021).
793	83.	Schneebeli-Hermann, E. et al. Vegetation history across the Permian-Triassic
794		boundary in Pakistan (Amb section, Salt Range). Gondwana Research 27, 911–924
795		(2015).
796	84.	Visscher, H. et al. The terminal paleozoic fungal event: Evidence of terrestrial
797		ecosystem destabilization and collapse. Proceedings of the National Academy of
798		Sciences of the United States of America 93, 2155–2158 (1996).
799	85.	Visscher, H., Sephton, M. A. & Looy, C. V. Fungal virulence at the time of the end-
800		Permian biosphere crisis? <i>Geology</i> <b>39</b> , 883–886 (2011).
801	86.	Looy, C. V., Twitchett, R. J., Dilcher, D. L., Van Konijnenburg-Van Cittert, J. H. A. &
802		Visscher, H. Life in the end-Permian dead zone. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy</i>
803		of Sciences of the United States of America 98, 7879–7883 (2001).
804	87.	Bercovici, A. & Vajda, V. Terrestrial Permian - Triassic boundary sections in South
805		China. <i>Global and Planetary Change</i> <b>143</b> , 31–33 (2016).
806	88.	Hochuli, P. A. Interpretation of "fungal spikes" in Permian-Triassic boundary sections.
807		Global and Planetary Change 144, 48–50 (2016).
808	89.	Angielczyk, K. D., Roopnarine, P. D. & Wang, S. C. Modeling the role of primary
809		productivity disruption in end-Permian extinctions. New Mexico Museum of Natural
810		History and Science Bulletin <b>30</b> , 16–23 (2005).

90. Labandeira, C. C. & Sepkoski, J. J. Insect diversity in the fossil record. Science 261, 811 310-315 (1993). 812 Shcherbakov, D. E. On Permian and Triassic insect faunas in relation to biogeography 91. 813 and the Permian-Triassic crisis. *Paleontological Journal* 42, 15–31 (2008). 814 Condamine, F. L., Clapham, M. E. & Kergoat, G. J. Global patterns of insect 92. 815 diversification: Towards a reconciliation of fossil and molecular evidence? Scientific 816 Reports 6, 19208 (2016). 817 Smith, R. M. H. & Ward, P. D. Pattern of vertebrate extinctions across an event bed at 93. 818 the Permian-Triassic boundary in the Karoo Basin of South Africa. Geology 29, 1147 819 (2001).820 94. Benton, M. J., Tverdokhlebov, V. P. & Surkov, M. V. Ecosystem remodelling among 821 vertebrates at the Permian-Triassic boundary in Russia. Nature 432, 97-100 (2004). 822 95. Viglietti, P. A. et al. Evidence from South Africa for a protracted end-Permian 823 extinction on land. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United 824 States of America 118, e2017045118 (2021). 825 Sennikov, A. G. & Golubev, V. K. Vyazniki biotic assemblage of the terminal 96. 826 Permian. Paleontological Journal 40, S475–S481 (2006). 827 97. Sennikov, A. G. & Golubev, V. K. On the faunal verification of the Permo-Triassic 828 boundary in continental deposits of eastern Europe: 1. Gorokhovets-Zhukov ravine. 829 Paleontological Journal 46, 313–323 (2012). 830 98. Zhu, Z. et al. Altered fluvial patterns in North China indicate rapid climate change 831 linked to the Permian-Triassic mass extinction. Scientific Reports 9, 16818 (2019). 832 99. Shen, S. Z. et al. Calibrating the end-Permian mass extinction. Science 334, 1367-833 1372 (2011). 834 Twitchett, R. J., Looy, C. V., Morante, R., Visscher, H. & Wignall, P. B. Rapid and 100. 835 synchronous collapse of marine and terrestrial ecosystems during the end-Permian 836 biotic crisis. Geology 29, 351-354 (2001). 837 Biswas, R. K., Kaiho, K., Saito, R., Tian, L. & Shi, Z. Terrestrial ecosystem collapse 101. 838 and soil erosion before the end-Permian marine extinction: Organic geochemical 839 evidence from marine and non-marine records. Global and Planetary Change 195, 840 103327 (2020). 841 Aftabuzzaman, Md. et al. End-Permian terrestrial disturbance followed by the 102. 842 complete plant devastation, and the vegetation proto-recovery in the earliest-Triassic 843 recorded in coastal sea sediments. Global and Planetary Change 205, 103621 (2021). 844 Gastaldo, R. A., Neveling, J., Geissman, J. W., Kamo, S. L. & Looy, C. V. A tale of 103. 845 two Tweefonteins: What physical correlation, geochronology, magnetic polarity 846 stratigraphy, and palynology reveal about the end-Permian terrestrial extinction 847 paradigm in South Africa. GSA Bulletin (2021) doi:10.1130/b35830.1. 848 104. Yan, Z. et al. Frequent and intense fires in the final coals of the Paleozoic indicate 849 elevated atmospheric oxygen levels at the onset of the End-Permian Mass Extinction 850 Event. International Journal of Coal Geology 207, 75-83 (2019). 851 105. DiMichele, W. A., Bashforth, A. R., Falcon-Lang, H. J. & Lucas, S. G. Uplands, 852 lowlands, and climate: Taphonomic megabiases and the apparent rise of a 853 xeromorphic, drought-tolerant flora during the Pennsylvanian-Permian transition. 854 Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 559, 109965 (2020). 855 Smith, R. M. H. & Botha-Brink, J. Anatomy of a mass extinction: Sedimentological 106. 856 and taphonomic evidence for drought-induced die-offs at the Permo-Triassic boundary 857 in the main Karoo Basin, South Africa. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, 858 Palaeoecology 396, 99–118 (2014). 859

860	107.	Xiong, C. & Wang, Q. Permian–Triassic land-plant diversity in South China: Was
861		there a mass extinction at the Permian/Triassic boundary? <i>Paleobiology</i> <b>37</b> , 157–167
862		(2011).
863	108.	Yu, J. et al. Terrestrial events across the Permian-Triassic boundary along the Yunnan-
864		Guizhou border, SW China. Global and Planetary Change 55, 193–208 (2007).
865	109.	Becker, L., Poreda, R. J., Hunt, A. G., Bunch, T. E. & Rampino, M. Impact event at
866		the permian-triassic boundary: Evidence from extraterrestrial noble gases in fullerenes.
867		Science <b>291</b> , 1530–1533 (2001).
868	110.	Basu, A. R., Petaev, M. I., Poreda, R. J., Jacobsen, S. B. & Becker, L. Chondritic
869		Meteorite Fragments Associated with the Permian-Triassic Boundary in Antarctica.
870		Science <b>302</b> , 1388–1392 (2003).
871	111.	Isozaki, Y. Permo-Triassic boundary superanoxia and stratified superocean: Records
872		from lost deep sea. Science 276, 235–238 (1997).
873	112.	French, B. M. & Koeberl, C. The convincing identification of terrestrial meteorite
874		impact structures: What works, what doesn't, and why. <i>Earth-Science Reviews</i> vol. 98
875		123–170 (2010).
876	113.	Saunders, A. D., England, R. W., Reichow, M. K. & White, R. V. A mantle plume
877		origin for the Siberian traps: Uplift and extension in the West Siberian Basin, Russia.
878		Lithos <b>79</b> , $407-424$ (2005).
879	114.	Reichow, M. K. <i>et al.</i> Petrogenesis and timing of mafic magmatism. South Taimyr.
880		Arctic Siberia: A northerly continuation of the Siberian Traps? <i>Lithos</i> <b>248–251</b> , 382–
881		401 (2016).
882	115.	Naldrett, A. J., Lightfoot, P. C., Fedorenko, V., Doherty, W. & Gorbachey, N. S.
883		Geology and geochemistry of intrusions and flood basalts of the Noril'sk region,
884		USSR, with implications for the origin of the Ni-Cu ores. <i>Economic Geology</i> 87, 975–
885		1004 (1992).
886	116.	Hawkesworth, C. J. et al. Magma differentiation and mineralisation in the Siberian
887		continental flood basalts. LITHOS 34, 61–88 (1995).
888	117.	Fedorenko, V. A. et al. Petrogenesis of the flood-basalt sequence at noril'sk, north
889		central siberia. International Geology Review 38, 99-135 (1996).
890	118.	Arndt, N., Chauvel, C., Czamanske, G. & Fedorenko, V. Two mantle sources, two
891		plumbing systems: Tholeiitic and alkaline magmatism of the Maymecha River basin,
892		Siberian flood volcanic province. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 133,
893		297–313 (1998).
894	119.	Sobolev, S. V. et al. Linking mantle plumes, large igneous provinces and
895		environmental catastrophes. Nature 477, 312-316 (2011).
896	120.	Sobolev, A. V., Arndt, N. T., Krivolutskaya, N. A., Kuzmin, D. V. & Sobolev, S. V.
897		The origin of gases that caused the permian-triassic extinction. in Volcanism and
898		Global Environmental Change 147–163 (2015). doi:10.1007/9781107415683.011.
899	121.	Black, B. A., Elkins-Tanton, L. T., Rowe, M. C. & Peate, I. U. Magnitude and
900		consequences of volatile release from the Siberian Traps. Earth and Planetary Science
901		Letters 317–318, 363–373 (2012).
902	122.	Broadley, M. W., Barry, P. H., Ballentine, C. J., Taylor, L. A. & Burgess, R. End-
903		Permian extinction amplified by plume-induced release of recycled lithospheric
904		volatiles. Nature Geoscience 11, 682–687 (2018).
905	123.	Elkins-Tanton, L. T. et al. Field evidence for coal combustion links the 252 Ma
906		Siberian Traps with global carbon disruption. Geology 48, 986–991 (2020).
907	124.	Grasby, S. E. & Beauchamp, B. Latest Permian to Early Triassic basin-to-shelf anoxia
908		in the Sverdrup Basin, Arctic Canada. Chemical Geology 264, 232-246 (2009).

909	125.	Grasby, S. E., Sanei, H. & Beauchamp, B. Catastrophic dispersion of coal fly ash into
910		oceans during the latest Permian extinction. Nature Geoscience 4, 104-107 (2011).
911	126.	Sanei, H., Grasby, S. E. & Beauchamp, B. Latest permian mercury anomalies. <i>Geology</i>
912		<b>40</b> , 63–66 (2012).
913	127.	Reichow, M. K., Saunders, A. D., White, R. V., Al'Mukhamedov, A. I. & Medvedev,
914		A. Y. Geochemistry and petrogenesis of basalts from the West Siberian Basin: An
915		extension of the Permo-Triassic Siberian Traps, Russia. <i>Lithos</i> <b>79</b> , 425–452 (2005).
916	128.	Jerram, D. A., Svensen, H. H., Planke, S., Polozov, A. G. & Torsvik, T. H. The onset
917		of flood volcanism in the north-western part of the Siberian Traps: Explosive
918		volcanism versus effusive lava flows. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
919		<i>Palaeoecology</i> <b>441</b> , 38–50 (2016).
920	129.	Svensen, H. <i>et al.</i> Siberian gas venting and the end-Permian environmental crisis.
921	1.0	Earth and Planetary Science Letters 277, 490–500 (2009).
922	130.	Svensen, H. H. <i>et al.</i> Sills and gas generation in the Siberian Traps. <i>Philosophical</i>
923		Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering
924	101	Sciences <b>376</b> , 20170080 (2018).
925	131.	Davydov, V. I. Tunguska coals, Siberian sills and the Permian-Triassic extinction.
926	100	Earth-Science Reviews vol. 212 103438 (2021).
927	132.	Callegaro, S. <i>et al.</i> Geochemistry of deep Tunguska Basin sills, Siberian Traps:
928		Contributions to Minoralogy and Potrology <b>176</b> 40 (2021)
929	122	Wooden LL <i>et al.</i> Isotonia and trace element constraints on months and crustel
930	155.	contributions to Siberian continental flood basalts Noril'sk area. Siberia, <i>Geochimica</i>
931		at Cosmochimica Acta 57, 3677, 3704 (1993)
932	134	Arndt N.T. Czmanske G.K. Walker R. I. Chauvel C. & Fedorenko V. A
930	154.	Geochemistry and origin of the intrusive hosts of the Noril'sk-Talnakh Cu-Ni-PGE
935		sulfide deposits. Economic Geology 98, 495–515 (2003).
936	135.	Pang, K. N. <i>et al.</i> A petrologic, geochemical and Sr-Nd isotopic study on contact
937		metamorphism and degassing of Devonian evaporites in the Norilsk aureoles, Siberia.
938		Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 165, 683–704 (2013).
939	136.	Yao, Z. sen & Mungall, J. E. Linking the Siberian Flood Basalts and Giant Ni-Cu-PGE
940		Sulfide Deposits at Norilsk. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 126,
941		(2021).
942	137.	Sibik, S., Edmonds, M., Maclennan, J. & Svensen, H. Magmas Erupted during the
943		Main Pulse of Siberian Traps Volcanism were Volatile-poor. Journal of Petrology 56,
944		2089–2116 (2015).
945	138.	Retallack, G. J. & Jahren, A. H. Methane release from igneous intrusion of coal during
946		late permian extinction events. Journal of Geology 116, 1–20 (2008).
947	139.	Iacono-Marziano, G. et al. Gas emissions due to magma-sediment interactions during
948		flood magmatism at the Siberian Traps: Gas dispersion and environmental
949		consequences. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 357–358, 308–318 (2012).
950	140.	Fristad, K. E., Svensen, H. H., Polozov, A. & Planke, S. Formation and evolution of
951		the end-Permian Oktyabrsk volcanic crater in the Tunguska Basin, Eastern Siberia.
952	1 4 1	Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 468, 76–87 (2017).
953	141.	Polozov, A. G. <i>et al.</i> The basalt pipes of the Tunguska Basin (Siberia, Russia): High
954		temperature processes and volatile degassing into the end-Permian atmosphere.
955	140	<i>Falaeogeography, Falaeoclimatology, Falaeoecology</i> <b>441</b> , 51–64 (2016).
956	142.	Elkins-Tanton, L. 1. <i>et al.</i> The last lavas erupted during the main phase of the Siberian
957		Mineralogy and Potnology <b>153</b> , 101, 200 (2007)
958		1000 - 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 1000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 100000 = 10000000 = 100000000

- Schmidt, A. *et al.* Selective environmental stress from sulphur emitted by continental flood basalt eruptions. *Nature Geoscience* 9, 77–82 (2016).
- 144. Black, B. A. *et al.* Systemic swings in end-Permian climate from Siberian Traps
   carbon and sulfur outgassing. *Nature Geoscience* 11, 949–954 (2018).
- Schobben, M., Joachimski, M. M., Korn, D., Leda, L. & Korte, C. Palaeotethys
   seawater temperature rise and an intensified hydrological cycle following the end Permian mass extinction. *Gondwana Research* 26, 675–683 (2014).
- 146. Chen, J. *et al.* Abrupt warming in the latest Permian detected using high-resolution in situ oxygen isotopes of conodont apatite from Abadeh, central Iran. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 560, 109973 (2020).
- I47. Joachimski, M. M., Alekseev, A. S., Grigoryan, A. & Gatovsky, Y. A. Siberian trap volcanism, global warming and the Permian-Triassic mass extinction: New insights from Armenian Permian-Triassic sections. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 132, 427–443 (2020).
- 148. Sun, Y. *et al.* Lethally hot temperatures during the early triassic greenhouse. *Science*338, 366–370 (2012).
- Joachimski, M. M. *et al.* Climate warming in the latest Permian and the Permian Triassic mass extinction. *Geology* 40, 195–198 (2012).
- Jiang, H., Joachimski, M. M., Wignall, P. B., Zhang, M. & Lai, X. A delayed endPermian extinction in deep-water locations and its relationship to temperature trends
  (Bianyang, Guizhou Province, South China). *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 440, 690–695 (2015).
- 151. Chen, J. *et al.* High-resolution SIMS oxygen isotope analysis on conodont apatite from
   South China and implications for the end-Permian mass extinction. *Palaeogeography*,
   *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 448, 26–38 (2016).
- 152. Shen, S. *et al.* Permian integrative stratigraphy and timescale of China. *Science China Earth Sciences* vol. 62 154–188 (2019).
- Pörtner, H. O. Oxygen- And capacity-limitation of thermal tolerance: A matrix for
   integrating climate-related stressor effects in marine ecosystems. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 213, 881–893 (2010).
- Pörtner, H. O. Integrating climate-related stressor effects on marine organisms:
   Unifying principles linking molecule to ecosystem-level changes. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 470, 273–290 (2012).
- Bijma, J., Pörtner, H. O., Yesson, C. & Rogers, A. D. Climate change and the oceans What does the future hold? *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 74, 495–505 (2013).
- 156. Song, H. *et al.* Flat latitudinal diversity gradient caused by the Permian–Triassic mass
   extinction. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 117, 17578–17583 (2020).
- Penn, J. L., Deutsch, C., Payne, J. L. & Sperling, E. A. Temperature-dependent
   hypoxia explains biogeography and severity of end-Permian marine mass extinction.
   *Science* 362, eaat1327 (2018).
- 158. Benton, M. J. Hyperthermal-driven mass extinctions: Killing models during the
   Permian-Triassic mass extinction. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences* vol. 376 20170076 (2018).
- 1003 159. Teskey, R. *et al.* Responses of tree species to heat waves and extreme heat events.
   1004 *Plant Cell and Environment* vol. 38 1699–1712 (2015).
- 160. Cai, Y. F., Zhang, H., Feng, Z. & Shen, S. Z. Intensive Wildfire Associated With
   Volcanism Promoted the Vegetation Changeover in Southwest China During the
   Permian–Triassic Transition. *Frontiers in Earth Science* 9, 615841 (2021).

- 161. Grasby, S. E. *et al.* Progressive environmental deterioration in northwestern Pangea
   leading to the latest Permian extinction. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 1010 127, 1331–1347 (2015).
- 162. Beauchamp, B. & Grasby, S. E. Permian lysocline shoaling and ocean acidification
   along NW Pangea led to carbonate eradication and chert expansion. *Palaeogeography*,
   *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 350–352, 73–90 (2012).
- Wignall, P. B. & Twitchett, R. J. Oceanic anoxia and the end permian mass extinction.
   *Science* 272, 1155–1158 (1996).
- Wignall, P. B. *et al.* Ultra-shallow-marine anoxia in an Early Triassic shallow-marine clastic ramp (Spitsbergen) and the suppression of benthic radiation. *Geological Magazine* 153, 316–331 (2016).
- 1019
  165. Proemse, B. C., Grasby, S. E., Wieser, M. E., Mayer, B. & Beauchamp, B.
  1020 Molybdenum isotopic evidence for oxic marine conditions during the latest permian
  1021 extinction. *Geology* 41, 967–970 (2013).
- 1022 166. Grasby, S. E. *et al.* Transient Permian-Triassic euxinia in the southern Panthalassa 1023 deep ocean. *Geology* **49**, 889–893 (2021).
- Wignall, P. B. *et al.* An 80 million year oceanic redox history from Permian to Jurassic
   pelagic sediments of the Mino-Tamba terrane, SW Japan, and the origin of four mass
   extinctions. *Global and Planetary Change* **71**, 109–123 (2010).
- 1027 168. Song, H. *et al.* Geochemical evidence from bio-apatite for multiple oceanic anoxic 1028 events during Permian-Triassic transition and the link with end-Permian extinction and 1029 recovery. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **353–354**, 12–21 (2012).
- 169. Grasby, S. E., Beauchamp, B., Embry, A. & Sanei, H. Recurrent Early Triassic ocean
   anoxia. *Geology* 41, 175–178 (2013).
- 1032 170. Takahashi, S., Yamasaki, S. ichi, Ogawa, K., Kaiho, K. & Tsuchiya, N. Redox
   1033 conditions in the end-Early Triassic Panthalassa. *Palaeogeography*,
   1034 *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 432, 15–28 (2015).
- 1035 171. Brennecka, G. A., Herrmann, A. D., Algeo, T. J. & Anbar, A. D. Rapid expansion of
   1036 oceanic anoxia immediately before the end-Permian mass extinction. *Proceedings of* 1037 *the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 108, 17631–17634
   1038 (2011).
- 1039 172. Takahashi, S. *et al.* Bioessential element-depleted ocean following the euxinic
  1040 maximum of the end-Permian mass extinction. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*1041 393, 94–104 (2014).
- 1042 173. Newton, R. J., Pevitt, E. L., Wignall, P. B. & Bottrell, S. H. Large shifts in the isotopic composition of seawater sulphate across the Permo-Triassic boundary in northern
  1044 Italy. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 218, 331–345 (2004).
- 1045 174. Grice, K. *et al.* Photic zone euxinia during the permian-triassic superanoxic event.
   1046 Science 307, 706–709 (2005).
- Ingall, E. & Jahnke, R. Evidence for enhanced phosphorus regeneration from marine
   sediments overlain by oxygen depleted waters. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* vol.
   58 2571–2575 (1994).
- 1050 176. Sun, Y. D. *et al.* Ammonium ocean following the end-Permian mass extinction. *Earth* 1051 *and Planetary Science Letters* 518, 211–222 (2019).
- 1052 177. Grasby, S. E., Beauchamp, B. & Knies, J. Early Triassic productivity crises delayed
   1053 recovery from world's worst mass extinction. *Geology* 44, 779–782 (2016).
- Schoepfer, S. D., Henderson, C. M., Garrison, G. H. & Ward, P. D. Cessation of a
   productive coastal upwelling system in the Panthalassic Ocean at the Permian-Triassic
   Boundary. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 313–314, 181–188
   (2012).

179. Schobben, M. et al. Flourishing ocean drives the end-Permian marine mass extinction. 1058 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 112, 1059 10298-10303 (2015). 1060 Grasby, S. E. et al. Global warming leads to Early Triassic nutrient stress across 180. 1061 northern Pangea. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America 132, 943–954 (2020). 1062 Song, H. et al. Conodont calcium isotopic evidence for multiple shelf acidification 181. 1063 events during the Early Triassic. Chemical Geology 562, (2021). 1064 182. Jurikova, H. et al. Permian-Triassic mass extinction pulses driven by major marine 1065 carbon cycle perturbations. Nature Geoscience 13, 745-750 (2020). 1066 Garbelli, C., Angiolini, L. & Shen, S. Z. Biomineralization and global change: A new 183. 1067 perspective for understanding the end-Permian extinction. Geology 45, 19–22 (2017). 1068 Clarkson, M. O. et al. Ocean acidification and the Permo-Triassic mass extinction. 184. 1069 Science 348, 229–232 (2015). 1070 185. Zhang, S. et al. Investigating controls on boron isotope ratios in shallow marine 1071 carbonates. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 458, 380–393 (2017). Hinojosa, J. L. et al. Evidence for end-Permian ocean acidification from calcium 186. 1073 isotopes in biogenic apatite. Geology 40, 743–746 (2012). 1074 Komar, N. & Zeebe, R. E. Calcium and calcium isotope changes during carbon cycle 187. 1075 perturbations at the end-Permian. Paleoceanography 31, 115–130 (2016). 1076 Silva-Tamayo, J. C. et al. Global perturbation of the marine calcium cycle during the 188. 1077 Permian-Triassic transition. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America 130, 1323-1078 1338 (2018). 1079 189. Payne, J. L. et al. Calcium isotope constraints on the end-Permian mass extinction. 1080 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 107, 1081 8543-8548 (2010). 1082 190. Lau, K. V. et al. The influence of seawater carbonate chemistry, mineralogy, and 1083 diagenesis on calcium isotope variations in Lower-Middle Triassic carbonate rocks. Chemical Geology 471, 13–37 (2017). 1085 Wang, J. et al. Coupled 844/40Ca, 888/86Sr, and 87Sr/86Sr geochemistry across the 191. 1086 end-Permian mass extinction event. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 262, 143-165 1087 (2019).Kiessling, W. & Simpson, C. On the potential for ocean acidification to be a general 192. 1089 cause of ancient reef crises. Global Change Biology 17, 56-67 (2011). 1090 Chen, Z. Q., Kaiho, K. & George, A. D. Early Triassic recovery of the brachiopod 193. 1091 faunas from the end-Permian mass extinction: A global review. in Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology vol. 224 270–290 (2005). 1093 Dai, X., Korn, D. & Song, H. Morphological selectivity of the Permian-Triassic 194. 1094 ammonoid mass extinction. Geology 49, 1112–1116 (2021). Fijałkowska-Mader, A. Impact of the Environmental Stress on the Late Permian Pollen 195. 1096 Grains from Zechstein Deposits of Poland. in Morphogenesis, Environmental Stress and Reverse Evolution 23-35 (2020). doi:10.1007/978-3-030-47279-5 3. 1098 196. Beerling, D. J., Harfoot, M., Lomax, B. & Pyle, J. A. The stability of the stratospheric 1099 ozone layer during the end-Permian eruption of the Siberian Traps. Philosophical 1100 Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering 1101 Sciences 365, 1843-1866 (2007). 1102 Svensen, H., Schmidbauer, N., Roscher, M., Stordal, F. & Planke, S. Contact 197. metamorphism, halocarbons, and environmental crises of the past. Environmental 1104 Chemistry 6, 466–471 (2009). 1105

1106	198.	Black, B. A., Lamarque, J. F., Shields, C. A., Elkins-Tanton, L. T. & Kiehl, J. T. Acid
1107		rain and ozone depletion from pulsed siberian traps magmatism. Geology 42, 67–70
1108		(2014).
1109	199.	Likens, G. E. & Butler, T. J. Acid Rain: Causes, Consequences, and Recovery in
1110		Terrestrial, Aquatic, and Human Systems. in <i>Encyclopedia of the Anthropocene</i> 23-31
1111		(2018). doi:10.1016/b978-0-12-809665-9.09977-8.
1112	200.	Sephton, M. A., Jiao, D., Engel, M. H., Looy, C. V. & Visscher, H. Terrestrial
1113		acidification during the end-Permian biosphere crisis? Geology 43, 159–162 (2015).
1114	201.	Sheldon, N. D. Abrupt chemical weathering increase across the Permian-Triassic
1115		boundary. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 231, 315–321 (2006).
1116	202.	Maruoka, T., Koeberl, C., Hancox, P. J. & Reimold, W. U. Sulfur geochemistry across
1117		a terrestrial Permian-Triassic boundary section in the Karoo Basin, South Africa. Earth
1118		and Planetary Science Letters 206, 101–117 (2003).
1119	203.	Grasby, S. E., Them, T. R., Chen, Z., Yin, R. & Ardakani, O. H. Mercury as a proxy
1120		for volcanic emissions in the geologic record. <i>Earth-Science Reviews</i> vol. 196 102880
1121		(2019).
1122	204.	Dal Corso, J. et al. Permo-Triassic boundary carbon and mercury cycling linked to
1123		terrestrial ecosystem collapse. Nature Communications 11, 2962 (2020).
1124	205.	Rugenstein, M. A. A., Sedláček, J. & Knutti, R. Nonlinearities in patterns of long-term
1125		ocean warming. Geophysical Research Letters 43, 3380-3388 (2016).
1126	206.	Yang, H. & Zhu, J. Equilibrium thermal response timescale of global oceans.
1127		Geophysical Research Letters vol. 38 L14711 (2011).
1128	207.	Song, H. et al. Anoxia/high temperature double whammy during the Permian-Triassic
1129		marine crisis and its aftermath. Scientific Reports 4, 4132 (2014).
1130	208.	Alroy, J. Accurate and precise estimates of origination and extinction rates.
1131		<i>Paleobiology</i> <b>40</b> , 374–397 (2014).
1132	209.	Scotese, C. R. Atlas of Permo-Triassic Paleogeographic Maps (Mollweide Projection),
1133		Maps 43 - 52, Volumes 3 & 4 of the PALEOMAP Atlas for ArcGIS, PALEOMAP
1134		Project, Evanston, IL. Technicla Report 3, (2014).
1135	210.	Zhang, F. et al. Two distinct episodes of marine anoxia during the Permian-Triassic
1136		crisis evidenced by uranium isotopes in marine dolostones. Geochimica et
1137		<i>Cosmochimica Acta</i> <b>287</b> , 165–179 (2020).
1138	211.	Wu, Y. et al. Six-fold increase of atmospheric pCO2 during the Permian–Triassic mass
1139		extinction. Nature Communications 12, 2137 (2021).
1140	212.	Grossman, E. L. & Joachimski, M. M. Oxygen Isotope Stratigraphy. in Geologic Time
1141		<i>Scale 2020</i> 279–307 (2020). doi:10.1016/b978-0-12-824360-2.00010-3.
1142	213.	Trotter, J. A., Williams, I. S., Barnes, C. R., Männik, P. & Simpson, A. New conodont
1143		δ18O records of Silurian climate change: Implications for environmental and
1144		biological events. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 443, 34–48
1145		(2016).
1146	214.	Kaiho, K. <i>et al.</i> End-Permian catastrophe by a bolide impact: Evidence of a gigantic
1147		release of sulfur from the mantle. Geology 29, 815–818 (2001).
1148	215.	Chu, D. et al. Lilliput effect in freshwater ostracods during the Permian-Triassic
1149	• • •	extinction. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology <b>435</b> , 38–52 (2015).
1150	216.	Shen, J. et al. Mercury evidence of intense volcanic effects on land during the
1151	015	permian-triassic transition. Geology 47, 1117–1121 (2019).
1152	217.	Cao, C., Wang, W., Liu, L., Shen, S. & Summons, R. E. Two episodes of 13C-
1153		depletion in organic carbon in the latest Permian: Evidence from the terrestrial
1154		sequences in northern Xinjiang, China. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 270, 251–
1155		257 (2008).

- Shen, J. *et al.* Evidence for a prolonged Permian–Triassic extinction interval from
   global marine mercury records. *Nature Communications* 10, 1563 (2019).
- Wang, X. *et al.* Mercury anomalies across the end Permian mass extinction in South
   China from shallow and deep water depositional environments. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 496, 159–167 (2018).
- Holser, W. T. *et al.* A unique geochemical record at the Permian/Triassic boundary.
   *Nature* 337, 39–44 (1989).
- Korte, C. & Kozur, H. W. Carbon-isotope stratigraphy across the Permian-Triassic boundary: A review. *Journal of Asian Earth Sciences* 39, 215–235 (2010).
- Luo, G. *et al.* Stepwise and large-magnitude negative shift in δ13Ccarb preceded the
   main marine mass extinction of the Permian-Triassic crisis interval. *Palaeogeography*,
   *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 299, 70–82 (2011).
- Shen, S. zhong *et al.* High-resolution δ13Ccarb chemostratigraphy from latest
  Guadalupian through earliest Triassic in South China and Iran. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 375, 156–165 (2013).
- Hermann, E. *et al.* A close-up view of the Permian-Triassic boundary based on
  expanded organic carbon isotope records from Norway (Trøndelag and Finnmark
  Platform). *Global and Planetary Change* 74, 156–167 (2010).
- Luo, G. *et al.* Vertical δ13Corg gradients record changes in planktonic microbial
   community composition during the end-Permian mass extinction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **396**, 119–131 (2014).
- 1177 226. Schneebeli-Hermann, E. *et al.* Evidence for atmospheric carbon injection during the
   1178 end-permian extinction. *Geology* 41, 579–582 (2013).
- Williams, M. L., Jones, B. G. & Carr, P. F. The interplay between massive volcanism
  and the local environment: Geochemistry of the Late Permian mass extinction across
  the Sydney Basin, Australia. *Gondwana Research* 51, 149–169 (2017).
- Wu, Y. *et al.* Organic carbon isotopes in terrestrial Permian-Triassic boundary sections
   of North China: Implications for global carbon cycle perturbations. *Bulletin of the Geological Society of America* 132, 1106–1118 (2020).
- Grasby, S. E., Liu, X., Yin, R., Ernst, R. E. & Chen, Z. Toxic mercury pulses into late
   Permian terrestrial and marine environments. *Geology* 48, 830–833 (2020).
- 1187 1188

# 1189

# 1190 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 1191 We thank Sarah Greene (University of Birmingham) for useful discussion of Earth System modelling.
- We thank "Ecosystem resilience and recovery from the Permo-Triassic crisis" project (EcoPT; grant
- NE/P013724/1), which is a part of the Biosphere Evolution, Transitions and Resilience (BETR)
- 1194 Program.

# 1195 **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

- JDC coordinated the developing of the article. All authors contributed to the writing of the manuscript
- and building of the figures.

# 1198 **COMPETING INTERESTS**

1199 The authors declare no competing interests.

## 1200 DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

- 1201 Data from the Paleobiology Database used for the new calculation of the marine extinction rate are
- available in the Supplementary Materials.

#### 1203 FIGURE CAPTIONS

Figure 1. The Permian-Triassic mass extinction and its world. The PTME, also know as the 1204 "Great Dying", is the largest extinction of the entire Phanerozoic, with severe losses both in marine 1205 and terrestrial ecosystems. The PTME world consisted in one single continent (Pangea) surrounded by 1206 a vast ocean (Panthalassa), and a giant gulf (Palaeo- and Neo-Thetys). The Siberian Traps Large 1207 Igneous Province erupted 2–7 million km<sup>3</sup> of basalt in the northern hemisphere during the PTME. The 1208 biological crisis was the result of the environmental changes triggered by the volcanic emissions from 1209 the Siberian Traps, including the emissions produced by contact metamorphism caused by magmatic 1210 intrusions in the host rocks, such as CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, halogens and metals, into the Permo-Triassic 1211 atmosphere–ocean system. a) Newly calculated Gap-filler (GF) extinction rates <sup>208</sup> (Supplementary 1212 Note 1) for marine animals show the PTME stands out as the most sever extinction event compared to 1213 other intervals. Along with the PTME, the Ordovician–Silurian, Frasnian–Famennian, end-Triassic, 1214 end-Cretaceous mass extinctions are usually regarded as the largest extinction events of the 1215 Phanerozoic, also known as the "Big 5". b) Palaeogeographic reconstruction of Earth during the 1216 Permo-Triassic transition. Palaeogeography is from ref.<sup>209</sup>. GSSP = Global Stratotype Section and 1217

1218 Point.

Figure 2. Marine mass extinction. Pattern of the extinction in marine settings and major recorded 1219 geochemical changes. High-resolution geochemical data coupled to species richness of different 1220 marine groups. Palaeontological data show two extinction pulses spanning the Permian-Triassic 1221 boundary (PTB). While the first pulse appears to be synchronous in different areas, the second major 1222 pulse of extinction may have been diachronous. Geochemical changes mark the marine extincion 1223 interval (the interval between the two pulses), and tastify for major environmental changes coeval to 1224 the biological crisis, as global warming ( $\delta^{18}$ O), oceanic anoxia (Uranium-isotope,  $\delta^{238}$ U, and sulfurisotope of carbonate-associated sulphate,  $\delta^{34}S_{CAS}$ ), and ocean acidification (Boron-isotope,  $\delta^{11}B$ , 1226 calcium-isotope,  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca). Carbon-isotope ( $\delta^{13}$ C) data come from the most updated compilations of 1227 ref. <sup>210,211</sup>. Oxygen-isotope ( $\delta^{18}$ O) data from conodont apatite are from StabisoDB (Stable Isotope 1228 Database for Earth System Research)  $^{212}$ .  $\delta^{18}$ O data measured with SIMS (Secondary Ion Mass 1229 Spectrometer) have been corrected by a factor of -0.6‰ according to estimates by ref.<sup>213</sup> of the offset 1230 between conodont in-situ SIMS and bulk IRMS (Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometer) analyses. 1231 Uranium-isotope ( $\delta^{238}$ U) data are from ref. <sup>210</sup>.  $\delta^{34}$ S<sub>CAS</sub> data are from ref. <sup>173,179,214</sup>.  $\delta^{11}$ B data from 1232 brachiopod calcite are from ref. <sup>182</sup>.  $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca data are from ref. <sup>186</sup>. Species richness from numerous 1233 PTB sections in South China is from ref.<sup>4</sup>. Genera richness from the Dolomites (Southern Alps, Italy) 1234 is from refs. <sup>24,25</sup>. 1235

Fig. 3. Extinction selectivity during the Permian–Triassic mass extinction. The pattern of the 1236 PTME suggests statistically significant extinction selectivity between different ecological groups, 1237 shedding lights on the causes of the marine mass extinction. However, even if selectivity clearly 1238 played a role, high extinction rates are recorded for all marine ecological groups. a) Summary of extiction selectivity trends observed in marine animals: Based on refs. <sup>4,37,38,41–44,183,194</sup>. b) Extinction 1240 magnitude among different ecological groups in South China<sup>4</sup>. There are significant differences 1241 (Mann Whitney test, p<0.05) between extinction severity among different ecologic groups, i.e., 1242 nekton vs benthos, buffered vs unbuffered, bivalve vs brachiopod. Selectivity between motile and non-1243 motile animals appears to have been less significant (p=0.05). Bars represent 95% confidence 1244 intervals. c) Ecological selectivity of global extinctions during the PTME <sup>43</sup>. A zero log-odds value 1245 means there is no association between the ecological traits and extinction. The unbuffered and 1246 carbonate-shell genera were preferentially killed (p<0.05). Selectivity between narrow-geographic-1247 and cosmopolitan-range genera is weaker. Selectivity among genera with calcite shell, infaunal, and 1248 lower abundance of individuals is not significant (p>0.05). 1249

Figure 4. Terrestrial mass extionction. Pattern of the extinction in terrestrial settings and major 1250 recorded geochemical changes. Organic C-isotope ( $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$ ), Hg and Hg/TOC, and main biological 1251 events from reference sections of the terrestrial PTME in Northwestern China <sup>102,215–217</sup>, South China 1252  $^{27,71,82}$ , Sydney Basin  $^{26,67}$  and Karoo Basin  $^{28,95}$ , and correlation with the marine  $\delta^{13}C_{carbonate}$  and 1253  $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$  (Meishan only) records <sup>217</sup>. The  $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$  record from Meishan has been used as a 1254 chemostratigraphic tool to correlate the marine GSSP to the terrestrial sections of Northwestern China 1255 <sup>217</sup>. Data from the terrestrial PTME records with high-resolution chemostratigraphic data and/or 1256 redioisotopic ages, which allow correlation with the marine PTME, indicate that the terrestrial crisis 1257 started before the marine mass extinction. Gigantopteris and Glossopteris forests collapsed 60 kyrs 1258 (South China) <sup>27,204</sup> to 370 kyrs (Sydney Basin) <sup>26,67</sup> before the marine extincion. Wildfire activity widespreadly increased <sup>27,67</sup>. Tetrapods experienced high extinction rates, probably over a relatively 1260 long interval of up to  $\sim 1$  Myr  $^{95}$ . Existing data strongly support that the terrestrial crisis started before 1261 the global marine mass extincion. Evidence of also an earlier marine crisis come from high-latitude 1262 northwetern margin og Pangea. 1263

## Figure 5. Link between Siberian Traps, extinction, C-cycle changes and global warming.

Radiomatric ages of the volcanic products (lava, tuff, and sills) of the Siberian Traps Large Igneous

Province (STLIP) and sedimentary Hg geochemistry (BOX 2) indicate this LIP was active during the

- PTME, and was linked to injection of isotopically-light carbon into the Permian–Triassic atmosphere–
- ocean system, as inferred by the C-isotopes ( $\delta^{13}$ C) record (BOX 1), which rised *p*CO<sub>2</sub> and increased
- global temperature, as shown by O-isotopes ( $\delta^{18}$ O) of conodont apatite. Different volcanic phases can

- be defined: a first mainly pyroclastic phase (lava and tuff), a second mainly intrusive phase (sills), and
- a final extrusive phase. **a**) Schematic map of the STLIP (adapted from refs. <sup>119,129</sup>) showing the
- 1272 predominance of lava, pyroclastic and subvolcanic magmatic products over cratonic and non-cratonic
- regions of this vast province. M-K stands for Maymecha-Kotuy. **b**) Geochemical data linking the
- 1274 STLIP to extinction and environmental changes. Dating U/Pb ages of intrusive and extrusive rocks of
- the Siberian Traps are from ref. <sup>18,21</sup>. Hg and Hg/TOC data are from ref. <sup>218,219</sup>. Only Hg/TOC data
- with TOC>0.2% have been plotted following the approach of ref. <sup>203</sup>. Source of  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O data as
- in Fig. 2. Time span of marine and terrestrial extinction intervals are as defined in Fig. 2. The eruption
- 1278 of STLIP was very likely the trigger of the Permian–Triassic mass extinction.

Figure 6. Extinction mechanisms. Summary of the volcanically-triggered extinction mechanism 1279 inferred from the geochemical, sedimentary and palaeontological record of the PTME and their 1280 recorded effects on biota. The initial mainly extrusive-pyroclastic volcanic phase is coeval to the 1281 initial terrestrial crisis, whilst the onset of intrusive volcanism is coeval with the marine extinction 1282 interval. The different volcanic styles and linked injection of greenhouse gases, halogens and metals 1283 (only the most relevant volcanic/volcanogenic gases are represented in the figure) in the end Permian-1284 earliest Triassic atmosphere-land-ocean system, triggered a cascade of environmental disturbances, as summarized in the figure, which firstly affected terrestrial ecosystems and high-latitude marine 1286 environments, and then marine biota. The effects of the environemtal changes on the physiology and 1287 ecology of terrestrial and marine biota were multiple, showing that a fatal combination of factors, 1288 sustained for a relatively long interval and each having selective effects on biota, led to the most severe extinction of the Phanerozoic. 1290

#### 1292 BOX 1: The Permian–Triassic boundary C-isotope record

Carbon isotopes ( $\delta^{13}$ C) are used as a chemostratigraphic tool to correlate marine and terrestrial 1293 successions around the world. Many high resolution  $\delta^{13}$ C records have been collected across the PTB and they provide a powerful correlation tool, which helps identifying the PTME interval and link 1295 biological and environmental phenomena recorded in different locations. Major  $\delta^{13}$ C shifts in 1296 carbonate ( $\delta^{13}C_{carbonate}$ )<sup>220–223</sup>, and marine and terrestrial total organic carbon ( $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$ )<sup>221,224,225</sup>, are 1297 documented during the PTME (Figs. 2 and 3). A 3–6‰ negative  $\delta^{13}C_{carbonate}$  excursion begins 1298 gradually in the lower C. yini Zone (C. bachmanni Zone) ~60 kyrs below the onset of the marine crisis <sup>59,221</sup>, before accelerating to reach a minimum values in the earliest Triassic (*H. parvus* to early *I. isostichia* Zone). Similar shifts are recorded by  $\delta^{13}$ C values from total organic matter, wood and 1301 leaves, allowing correlation of non-marine to marine records (for example refs. <sup>217,225–228</sup>; Fig. 2 and 1302 3). However, because  $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$  is dependent on variable contributions of algal vs. bacterial and marine 1303 vs. terrigenous organic matter, some records display non-parallel trends in  $\delta^{13}C_{carbonate}$  and  $\delta^{13}C_{TOC}$ , as 1304 documented, for example, at Meishan GSSP section <sup>225</sup>. A variety of mechanisms were suggested to 1305 explain the negative  $\delta^{13}$ C shifts by the addition of isotopically light carbon to the exogenic carbon-1306 cycle reservoirs. Besides soil erosion, reduced primary productivity and destabilization of gas 1307 hydrates, Siberian Traps volcanism and related processes were favoured as the ultimate cause. 1308 Identification of the source of the isotopically light carbon and its  $\delta^{13}$ C signature is critical to estimate 1309 the amount of carbon transferred into the PTB atmosphere-ocean system, and to model atmospheric 1310  $pCO_2$  increase, temperature rise and seawater pH decline. 1311

1312

1313

#### 1315 BOX 2: Tracing Siberian Traps activity in the sedimentary record

Significant increases in mercury (Hg) concentrations above background occur at marine and terrestrial 1316 PTME boundaries globally, and have been attributed to Hg emissions from the Siberian Traps Large 1317 Igneous Province (STLIP) <sup>27,126,203</sup>. If correct, Hg serves as a 'fingerprint' of STLIP in the 1318 sedimentary record, allowing temporal correlation between the eruption and the extinction with 1319 resolution on a millennial time scale <sup>229</sup>. As a volatile gas Hg has sufficient atmospheric residence 1320 time for inter-hemispheric mixing, until eventually being transferred through wet or dry deposition to 1321 the marine and terrestrial environment, and after going through various biogeochemical cycling, 1322 eventual geologic sequestration in sediments <sup>203,229</sup>. In theory then, enhanced Hg emissions related to 1323 the STLIP should be recorded as an Hg spike in sediments <sup>229</sup>. This is not definitive though as 1324 concurrent changes in sequestration pathways, such as enhanced bioproductivity and consequent 1325 increased organic matter drawdown, could also create Hg spikes. Careful analyses of Hg data and 1326 sequestration pathways is required before a linkage with STLIP is possible. Stable isotope data (Fig. 1327 3), particularly mass independent fractionation (MIF), support Hg anomalies in offshore marine 1328 deposits being largely derived from a volcanic source <sup>203</sup>. However, these same data show nuances in 1329 the Hg cycle. Nearshore deposits have Hg spikes with a MIF signature of terrestrial vegetation <sup>203</sup>, 1330 likely related to devastation of forest and swamp ecosystems at that time <sup>203,204</sup>. Whether Hg 1331 anomalies are directly from volcanos, or indirectly from terrestrial reservoirs released through STLIP 1332 induced global warming, they both serve as a fingerprint (or LIP mark) of STLIP. Resolving the 1333 relative Hg pathways requires further work, along with understanding of how terrestrial and marine 1334 Hg records can be used to resolve the apparent diachronous extinction. Figure is adapted from ref.<sup>203</sup> 1335

GLOSSA	RY (in alphabetic order)
ALKALINE	
Any rock	of a magmatic series presenting a high content of alkali (Na <sub>2</sub> O and K <sub>2</sub> O) relative to silica
(SiO <sub>2</sub> ).	
BIOSTRATI	GRAPHY
Technique	e to determine the relative age of sedimentary rocks using their fossil content.
CHEMOSTR	ATIGRAPHY
The study changes a	of geochemical variations in sedimentary rocks; Globally-recorded chemostratigraphic re used to correlate sedimentary sequences.
CONODONT	
The hard p	part of an extinct jawless vertebrates, similar to an eel.
EVOLUTION	JARY FAUNA
A fauna ty fauna, Pal	pe that typically shows an increase in biodiversity following a logistic curve, i.e., Camb eozoic fauna, and Modern fauna.
FRAMBOID	AL PYRITE
Aggregate	es of pyrite (sulfide mineral, FeS <sub>2</sub> ) with a "ruspberry" ("la framboise" in french) aspect. I
used as a j	palaeo-redox proxy.
GSSP	
Global Sti between g	eological stages, for example between the Permian and the Triassic, are defined.
JUVENILE V	/OLATILE
A gas spec atmospher	cies that is dissolved in, or exsolved from, a magma, and is thus newly introduced to the re when the magma reaches the Earth's surface.
LARGE IGN	EOUS PROVINCE
Rapidly en >0.1 milli	mplaced (<1–5 Myrs) volcanic provinces with areal extents >0.1 million $\text{km}^2$ and volume on $\text{km}^3$ .
MASS EXTR	NCTION
Global bio	plogical events of greatly elevated extinction rates.
OCEANIC A	NOXIC EVENT
Interval of	f severely reduced dissolved oxygen content in the ocean.
ORIGINATI	ON RATES
The ratio	of the number of newly occurring species/genera to the total number over a given geolog
period.	
PYROCLAS	ПС
Volcanic	rock composed by fragmented pieces of lava. Coarser pyroclastic fragments accumulate
proximity	to the erupting vent, while finer particles can travel hundreds of kilometres.
PYROXENIT	TIC MANTLE SOURCE
A mantle represent	source dominated by the presence of pyroxene and by paucity or lack of olivine. They enriched and very fertile mantle lithologies.
RADIOISOT	OPE DATING
Technique	e to determine the absolute age of rocks using radioactive decay.
SIGNOR-LI	PPS EFFECT

- A paleontological principle which states that the fossil record of organisms is never complete.
- 1396 1397 **SILL**
- A tabular subvolcanic magma-body, emplaced roughly concordant or to the general bedding (stratification or layering) of its host-rocks.
- 1400 1401 SPORE TETRAD
- Four connected immature spore grains in tetrahedral or tetragonal fashion produces by meiotic
- 1403 microsporogenesis.
- 1404
- 1405 TERATOLOGICAL SPOROMORPHS
- Pollen and spores that present congenital abnormalities, such as lack of full development and
- 1407 malformations in their structure.
- 1408
- 1409 THOLEIITIC
- 1410 Sub-alkaline series of magmatic rocks, which undergo iron enrichment during differentiation due to
- their poorly oxidised state. Tholeiites are the products of extensive melting of the mantle.
- 1412
- 1413
- 1414
- 1415
- 1416