# **UNIVERSITY** OF BIRMINGHAM University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

### Temporal trends in radiometrically dated sediment cores from English lakes show polybrominated diphenyl ethers correlate with brominated but not mixed bromo/chloro dioxins and furans

Peters, Leon I.; Rose, Neil L.; Yang, Handong; Klánová, Jana; Moehring, Thomas; Harrad, Stuart

DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143118

License: Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND)

Document Version Peer reviewed version

*Citation for published version (Harvard):* Peters, LI, Rose, NL, Yang, H, Klánová, J, Moehring, T & Harrad, S 2021, 'Temporal trends in radiometrically dated sediment cores from English lakes show polybrominated diphenyl ethers correlate with brominated but not mixed bromo/chloro dioxins and furans', *Science of the Total Environment*, vol. 762, 143118. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143118

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

#### **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?) •Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

#### Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

1	<b>Temporal Trends in Radiometrically Dated Sediment Cores</b>
2	from English Lakes Show Polybrominated Diphenyl Ethers
3	<b>Correlate with Brominated but not Mixed Bromo/Chloro</b>
4	<b>Dioxins and Furans</b>
5	
6	Leon I. Peters <sup>a#</sup> , Neil L. Rose <sup>b</sup> , Handong Yang <sup>b</sup> , Jana Klánová <sup>c</sup> , Thomas Moehring <sup>d</sup> , Stuart
7	$Harrad^{a^*}$
8	
9	<sup>a</sup> School of Geography, Earth, and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham,
10	Birmingham, B15 2TT, U.K.
11	<sup>b</sup> Environmental Change Research Centre, Department of Geography, University College London,
12	London, WC1E 6BT, U.K.
13	<sup>c</sup> RECETOX, Masaryk University, Brno, Czech Republic
14	<sup>d</sup> Thermo Fisher Scientific (GmbH) Bremen, Hanna-Kunath-Str. 11, 28199 Bremen, Germany
15	
16	<sup>#</sup> Deceased
17	*Email address: S.J.Harrad@bham.ac.uk
18	

Peters et al 2020 Page 1 of 31

#### 19 ABSTRACT

20 This paper reports concentrations between ~1950 and present, of polybrominated diphenyl ethers 21 (PBDEs) and polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins and furans (PBDD/Fs), in radiometrically-dated 22 sediment cores from three English lakes. Mixed bromo/chloro dibenzo-p-dioxins and furans 23 (PXDD/Fs) were measured in two of the same lakes. Concentrations of PXDD/Fs decreased over 24 time to the present. To our knowledge, this is the first report of temporal trends of PXDD/Fs in the 25 environment. In contrast, concentrations of PBDEs increased towards the present and were 26 significantly correlated (R = 0.88 - 0.98; p<0.05) with concentrations of PBDFs in all three lakes. 27 These observations suggest that the sources of PXDD/Fs are not related to PBDEs and differ from 28 those of PBDFs. We also report for the first time the presence of octabromodibenzofuran (OBDF) 29 in the two most recent core slices at one lake. The source of OBDF in these samples is unclear. 30 While OBDF has been reported previously as a significant contaminant of some commercial 31 formulations of Deca-BDE, it is also present in Octa-BDE products and in emissions from a variety 32 of combustion activities. Overall, while the positive correlation between PBDEs and PBDFs 33 suggests increased use of PBDEs has contributed substantially to environmental contamination 34 with PBDFs; examination of PBDF homologue patterns implies emissions from combustion 35 activities are likely also important.

### 36 Keywords

37 PBDD/Fs; PXDD/Fs; PBDEs; Time Trends; Sources; Lakes

#### 38 Introduction

39 Polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) are industrial chemicals that have found extensive global 40 use as flame retardants added to a wide range of consumer items such as electrical and electronic 41 equipment and furniture fabrics and foams. As a consequence of their environmental persistence, 42 potential for long-range atmospheric transport and bioaccumulation, and adverse effects on 43 humans and/or wildlife, PBDEs are listed under the United Nations Environment Program's 44 Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs). Moreover, manufacture and new 45 use of PBDEs is either banned or restricted by many jurisdictions. Against this backdrop, there is a 46 clear need to evaluate the efficacy of such actions; for example, by monitoring temporal trends in 47 environmental contamination. Several studies worldwide have previously delineated the increase 48 in concentrations of PBDEs in the environment from the onset of their widespread use in the 1980s 49 to mid-2000s when the first restrictions on them were introduced (Kohler et al, 2008; Zegers et al, 50 2003; Vane et al, 2010; Webster et al, 2008). Subsequent trends up to the present, point to 51 concentrations levelling off and even declining as actions to eliminate PBDEs take effect (Yang et 52 al, 2016). One concern with respect to PBDEs is that commercial PBDE products have been shown 53 to contain polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins and furans (PBDD/Fs) as contaminants at levels that 54 amount to a substantial mass (0.43 - 2.2 t globally) of PBDD/Fs (Hanari et al, 2006; Ren et al, 55 2011). This is consistent with a recent report that temporal trends of PBDFs correlate with those of 56 PBDEs in sediment cores from Tokyo Bay (Goto et al, 2017). This is concerning owing to evidence 57 of the toxicity of PBDFs that is considered by the WHO to be on a par with that of their chlorinated 58 analogs (Van den Berg et al, 2013). Moreover, there exists emerging concern about environmental 59 contamination with mixed bromo-/chloro-dibenzo-p-dioxins and furans (PXDD/Fs) (Wall et al, 60 2015). Although little is known about the toxicity of PXDD/Fs, their structural similarity to

61 PBDD/Fs means that establishing the level at which they are present in the environment and 62 elucidating their sources is desirable. Studies exist that demonstrate that combustion activities such 63 as iron ore sintering and waste incineration are sources of PXDD/Fs (Chatkittikunwong and 64 Creaser, 1994; Weber et al, 2003), with their presence in air in Japan (Hayakawa et al, 2004) as 65 well as soil impacted by a recycling plant fire (Myers et al, 2012) and by informal e-waste handling 66 reported (Leung et al, 2007; Ma et al, 2008; Tue et al, 2013; Yu et al, 2008; Zennegg et al, 2009). Currently however, very few data exist on concentrations of PXDD/Fs in sediments. 67 68 Concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PXDD/Fs were between 0.03-0.1 ng/g dry weight in freshwater sediment taken 69 from a former chlor-alkali plant in the USA, with monobromoheptachloro dibenzo-p-dioxin the 70 only congener detected (Kannan et al, 1998). In Osaka Bay, Japan, a wider range of PXDD/Fs 71 were detected in marine sediment, most prominently 2-Br-3,7,8-ClCDD detected between 0.84-6.5 pg/g dry weight (Ohta et al, 2002), while concentrations of monobromo-polychlorinated 72 73 dibenzo-p-dioxins/dibenzofurans which ranged between below detection limit and 1.8 ng/g dry 74 weight were reported for marine surficial sediments from Hong Kong and Korea (Terauchi et al, 75 2009).

In this study we exploit the fact that sediment deposited in lakes over time can provide a reliable record of contaminant inputs into lacustrine systems. We thus collected sediment cores from three English lakes for which data on concentrations of PBDEs, hexabromocyclododecane (HBCDD), and polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) have been measured previously (Yang et al, 2016) and used radiometric techniques to assign dates to core slices representing different depths. Concentrations of PBDEs, PBDD/Fs, and PXDD/Fs were measured in individual core slices and the data used to test the hypothesis that these contaminant classes will display similar temporal trends.

#### 83 2. Experimental

#### 84 2.1 Sampling locations

85 A map of our sampling locations is given as supplementary data (Figure SD-1), with additional 86 information about individual sites supplied in Table SD-1. Locations studied were 3 of the same 87 seepage lakes for which we have previously reported temporal trends in concentrations of PBDEs, 88 HBCDD, and PCBs in sediment cores (Yang et al, 2016). These were: Edgbaston Pool, Holt Hall 89 Lake, and Wake Valley Pond. These lakes were selected from locations with a range of population 90 densities as a surrogate indicator of anthropogenic inputs. One sediment core from each lake was collected between  $23^{rd} - 26^{th}$  June 2015, covering sedimentation from at least ~1950 to the date of 91 92 sampling. Consistent with our previous study of these lakes (Yang et al, 2016), each core was 93 collected from a flat area of the lake basin near the deepest point.

#### 94 2.2 Sampling and sectioning of lake sediment cores

95 Cores were sampled from a flat area close to the maximum depth at each site and were collected 96 from a purpose built pontoon to a depth of between 0.75-0.95 m below the benthic surface using a 97 large diameter sediment core apparatus ('Big-Ben') (Patmore et al, 2014). The sediment corer, 98 piston and core covers were all thoroughly decontaminated with hexane before and after use. The 99 'Big-Ben' corer having an internal diameter of 140 mm, is considerably larger than conventional 100 piston corers (typically 50 - 80 mm i.d.) and provides sediment cores with a cross-sectional area of 154 cm<sup>2</sup> resulting in far greater sample for analysis, and facilitating the analysis of PBDD/Fs and 101 PXDD/Fs at the anticipated ultra-trace levels. Sediment cores were extruded vertically in the field 102 at 10 mm intervals, with each sample stored at -20° C in individually sealed Whirl-Pack<sup>TM</sup> 103 sampling bags until extraction analysis. Sample contamination derived from use of Whirl-Pack<sup>TM</sup> 104 105 sampling bags manufactured from low density polyethylene (LDPE) was controlled for with the use of sampling blanks, which consisted of 30 g pre- cleaned Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> spiked with 10 µL 106

Peters et al 2020 Page 6 of 31

<sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>-BDE-138. Sampling control blanks were opened to the atmosphere for approximately 30 min to allow the sampling spike solvent to evaporate, before being homogenised and sealed until analysis. Three sampling blanks were employed per site and treated analogously to sediment samples, including extraction and analysis. Recoveries of <sup>13</sup>C<sub>12</sub>-BDE-138 ranged between 50 - 110 % with a mean of 85.4  $\pm$  35.2 % (Mean  $\pm$  1SD) and all cases (n= 9) yielded BFR concentrations below limits of quantification confirming that the sample collection procedure did not contribute to sediment contamination with PBDEs.

114 Each sediment sample was divided into two during the core-sectioning procedure: two thirds kept 115 for analysis of our target contaminants; with the remaining one third used for radiometric dating 116 and determination of sediment water and total organic carbon (TOC) content. The latter two metrics were determined gravimetrically by mass loss from a 2 g (wet weight) sample, oven dried 117 at 105 °C for 3 h to determine water content and a further 2 h at 550 °C to determine TOC by 118 119 loss-on-ignition. After freeze-drying, each 10 mm core slice was homogenized. Thereafter, based 120 on information from our radiometric dating results, we combined 10 mm core slices from the same 121 core to generate a series of pooled core slice samples that each represented around five years of 122 sedimented material. In total, 31 such pooled samples were prepared for analysis. A further core 123 slice was analyzed from the bottom of the core taken from each of our lakes, to provide an 124 indication of concentrations of our target contaminants prior to ~1950.

125 Analytical methods

126 Details of methods used to radiometrically date (using <sup>210</sup>Pb) sediment core slices are given as SD,

127 with sediment chronologies and sedimentation rates provided as Tables SD-2-SD-4 and Figures

- 128 SD-2-SD-7. For determination of concentrations of target contaminants in sediment samples, 5 g
- 129 each of both hydromatrix and sodium sulfate (both pre-cleaned) were loaded into pre-cleaned

Peters et al 2020 Page 7 of 31

130	stainless steel extraction cells, along with an aliquot of freeze-dried and homogenized sediment
131	core slice (typically 5 g, accurately weighed). This was treated with <sup>13</sup> C-labeled internal standards
132	(details below) and subjected to pressurized liquid extraction using an ASE-350 (Dionex, CA).
133	Extraction was first with hexane:dichloromethane (3:2, v/v; 2 cycles), followed by toluene (2
134	cycles) at 90°C, 1500 psi and hold time= 5 min. Following concentration to $\sim 1 \text{ mL}$ using a
135	Turbovap solvent evaporator, crude sediment extracts were purified prior to instrumental analysis
136	via elution through a sequence of acid silica and activated carbon columns (Cape Technologies,
137	Maine, USA). This yielded two concentrated extracts (F1b and F2b) for instrumental analysis of
138	PBDEs (F1b) and PBDD/Fs + PXDD/Fs (F2b) for each sediment core slice. Detailed descriptions
139	of the complex procedures used to purify and fractionate sediment core extracts prior to
140	instrumental analysis are provided as SD (Figures SD-8-10 and accompanying text).
141	Commercially available standards were used for the analysis of BFRs. These comprised native
142	PBDEs and <sup>13</sup> C <sub>12</sub> -BDEs 28, 47, 99, 100, 153, 154, 183, 207, and 209 (Wellington Laboratories)
143	and native and ${}^{13}C_{12}$ - analogues of the following PBDD/Fs (Cambridge Isotope Laboratories):
144	2,3,7,8-TBDD, 1,2,3,7,8-PeBDD, 1,2,3,4,7,8-HxBDD, 1,2,3,6,7,8-HxBDD, 1,2,3,7,8,9-HxBDD,
145	1,2,3,4,6,7,8-HpBDD, OBDD, 2,3,7,8-TBDF, 2,4,6,8-TBDF, 1,2,3,7,8-PeBDF, 2,3,4,7,8-PBDF,
146	1,2,3,4,7,8-HxBDF, 1,2,3,4,6,7,8-HpBDF, and OBDF. The following native standards of
147	PXDD/Fs were kindly provided by Dr. Alwyn Fernandes, FERA, UK: 2-Br-7,8-CDD,
148	2-Br-3,7,8-CDD, 2,3-Br-7,8-CDD, 1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDD+2-Br-1,3,7,8-CDD, 2-Br-3,6,7,8,9-CDD,
149	2-Br-7,8-CDF, 2-Br-6,7,8-CDF+3-Br,2,7,8-CDF, and 1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDF. In the absence of
150	<sup>13</sup> C <sub>12</sub> -labeled PXDD/Fs, <sup>13</sup> C <sub>12</sub> -2,4,6,8-TBDF was used as internal (surrogate) standard for
151	quantification of PBDD/Fs.

152 Instrumental Analysis

Peters et al 2020 Page 8 of 31

153 Quantification of target compounds and congener groups was conducted on a Thermo Scientific 154 GC Q Exactive GC/orbitrap MS. Concentrations of PBDEs were determined via injection of 2 µL 155 of F1 onto a Thermo Fisher Scientific Trace Gold Dioxin capillary column (12 m x 0.25 mm x 0.1 156 µm), with the GC-MS operated in selected ion monitoring (SIM) mode. Concentrations of 157 PBDD/Fs and PXDD/Fs were determined by injecting 2 µL of F2 onto the same GC column, with 158 the GC-MS operated in full scan mode. For both F1 and F2, extracts were injected via a PTV 159 injector operating in splitless mode. A programmed temperature of injection of 120 °C followed by 160 a ramp profile from 150 °C to 320 °C at 14.5 °C/sec was deployed. A constant He flow of 1.3 161 mL/min was deployed with a temperature program of: 120 °C held for 3 min before ramping to 250 162 °C at 6.5 °C/min, followed by a second ramp from 250 °C to 305 °C at 8 °C/min held for 7 min. The 163 orbitrap MS was operated at 60,000 mass resolution, which facilitated confirmation of analyte 164 identity via accurate mass. In all cases, where a standard for a given compound was included in our 165 calibration standard, identification of that compound was via comparison of retention time to the 166 standard, while quantification of that compound was made using its response factor relative to the 167 appropriate internal (surrogate) standard. For PBDD/F and PXDD/F compounds for which we did 168 not have standards, quantification was achieved using an averaged relative response factor for 169 compounds of the same homologue group. For example, hexabromo-PBDFs were quantified using 170 the relative response factor for 1,2,3,4,7,8-HxBDF. Full details of mass spectrometric parameters 171 are provided as SD.

172 *QA/QC* 

173 Recoveries for all target analyte internal standards ranged between 50 and 110 %, with the

- 174 exception of  ${}^{13}C_{12}$ -OBDD and  ${}^{13}C_{12}$ -OBDF for which recoveries in some samples were as low as
- 175 40%. Method accuracy was assessed for PBDEs by replicate (n=7) analysis of NIST SRM1944

Peters et al 2020 Page 9 of 31

176 (New York/ New Jersey Waterway Sediment). This revealed good agreement between

177 concentrations measured in this study with the certified values reported by NIST. Full details are

178 provided in SD (Table SD-5). While certified or indicative values have not previously been

179 reported for PBDD/Fs and PXDD/Fs, they are also provided as SD (Tables SD-6 and SD-7) for

180 comparison with future studies.

181 Statistical methods

182 All statistics in this study were conducted using IBM SPSS Statistics 21, and Microsoft Excel183 2007.

#### 184 **Results and discussion**

#### 185 Concentrations of PBDEs

186 Concentrations of all target PBDEs and PBDD/Fs in each individual core slice from each sampling 187 location are provided as supporting data (Tables SD-8 – SD-13). Table 1 provides a summary of 188 concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDEs detected in this study together with those reported in selected relevant 189 previous studies for comparison. Most pertinently, concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDEs reported for surficial 190 sediments for our three lakes match closely with those reported previously by our group for 191 surficial sediments (albeit dating from 6-7 years earlier) for the same lakes (Yang et al, 2016). 192 While the lake situated in the local authority with the highest population density (Edgbaston Pool) 193 displayed the greatest concentrations of **SPBDEs**, concentrations at Wake Valley Pond and Holt 194 Hall Lake are similar despite Wake Valley Pond being located in a more densely populated local authority area (Table SD-1 – i.e. Edgbaston Pool 2,500 people/km<sup>2</sup> >Wake Valley Pond 250-499 195 people/km<sup>2</sup> >Holt Hall Lake 100-249 people/km<sup>2</sup>). This is partly consistent with previous findings 196 197 showing higher concentrations of PBDEs in air and soil from more densely populated areas due to

Peters et al 2020 Page 10 of 31

198 emissions from the built environment (Harrad and Hunter, 2006). Concentrations of ΣPBDEs in

199 this study at Edgbaston Pool ca 3 km from the center of the city of Birmingham are close to the

200 average reported for surficial sediments collected in 2011 from 45 locations along the River

201 Thames in the UK (Ganci et al, 2019). By comparison, those at Holt Hall Lake and Wake Valley

202 Pond are around an order of magnitude lower than at Edgbaston Pool. When compared to ΣPBDE

203 concentrations in surficial sediments collected in 2002-2003 as part of two studies conducted in

industrial areas of the River Clyde in Scotland (Vane et al, 2010; Webster et al, 2008),

205 concentrations at all three lakes in our study are substantially lower.

206 Relative Abundance of PBDE Congeners

207 The PBDE congener pattern in all our samples is dominated by BDE-209. This is consistent with

208 industry figures that in Europe, Deca-BDE production far exceeded that of both Penta- and

209 Octa-BDE (BSEF, 2003). It is also in line with previous reports for the same lakes (Yang et al,

210 2016), with sediment cores from the Clyde Estuary in Scotland, UK (Vane et al, 2010; Webster et

al, 2008), and with surficial sediments from the River Thames running through London, UK (Ganci

et al, 2019). Consistent with the Clyde Estuary, the relative contribution of the nona-BDEs-206,

213 -207, and -208 to ΣPBDEs in this study exceeds that observed in commercial formulations of

214 Deca-BDE. Specifically, in the top three core slices from all three locations, Σnona-BDEs

215 comprises 8-27% of ΣBDEs. This compares to 2.5 and 9.3% respectively in the commercial

216 Deca-BDE formulations Saytex 102E and Bromkal 82-0DE (La Guardia et al, 2006). While the

217 contribution of Σnona-BDEs to ΣBDEs is higher in the commercial Octa-BDE products DE-79 and

Bromkal 79-8DE at 12.1 and 18.9% respectively (La Guardia et al, 2006); the contribution of the

219 main indicator congener for Octa-BDE (BDE-183) to ΣPBDEs in our sediments is much lower

220 (0.45-2.1% in the top three slices at all lakes) than in DE-79 and Bromkal 79-8DE (42% and 12.6%

Peters et al 2020 Page 11 of 31

221 respectively). On this evidence, the presence of the three nona-BDEs in this study seem most likely 222 attributable to debromination of BDE-209. This is supported by the fact that BDE-209 and 223 Σnona-BDEs are positively correlated (p <0.05 at Edgbaston Pool; p<0.1 at Wake Valley Pond and 224 Holt Hall Lake) at each lake studied here. Similar conclusions were drawn based on the 225 observation that nona-BDEs were the second most abundant homologue group after BDE-209 in 226 river sediments from China (Mai et al, 2005; Zhang et al, 2009). However, we note a report of 227 elevated abundances of BDE-208 relative to BDE-209 in TV/PC display casings, and PC 228 components sampled in South China. In this study the authors attributed to the decomposition of 229 higher brominated PBDEs during the process of manufacturing use and/or recycling of 230 PBDE-containing products (Chen et al., 2010). Specifically, the ratios of average concentrations 231 of BDE-208: average concentrations of BDE-209 in TV and PC housing were 5.4% and 2.8% 232 respectively. By comparison, BDE-208:BDE-209 ratios in the uppermost 4 core slices in our 233 study ranged from 0.2% to 0.6% at Edgbaston Pool; 1.3% to 2.0% at Wake Valley Pond; and 1.3% 234 to 9.5% at Holt Hall Lake. It is thus possible that the nona-BDEs detected in our study have 235 arisen at least in part to emissions from treated products as well as any post-emission 236 debromination (Law et al., 2008). 237 Temporal Trends in PBDEs in English Lake Sediments 238 Figure 1 plots the temporal trends in concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDEs at all three locations. Given the 239 predominant contribution of BDE-209 to  $\Sigma$ PBDEs, the trends in  $\Sigma$ PBDEs reflect those of 240 BDE-209. Importantly, BDE-209 concentrations in the cores from Edgbaston Pool and Wake 241

- 241 Valley Pond do not peak in the uppermost core slice (2015); instead the highest concentrations are
- found in the slice immediately below (2012 and 2009 for Edgbaston Pool and Wake Valley Pond
- 243 respectively). The situation differs for Holt Hall Lake, where the highest BDE-209 concentration is

Peters et al 2020 Page 12 of 31

in the surficial sediment (2015). Overall, this suggests that while the full impact of recent

- 245 restrictions on the manufacture and use of Deca-BDE has yet to manifest itself at the lakes studied
- 246 here; there are tentatively encouraging signs that contamination is levelling off.

247 Concentrations, Relative Abundance, and Possible Sources of PBDD/Fs in English Lake

248 Sediments

249 PBDD/Fs were detected in all samples in this study at concentrations two orders of magnitude

250 below those of PBDEs. Table 1 compares ΣPBDD/F concentrations in this study compared to those

251 reported in a variety of previous studies from other locations. Concentrations in sediment core

slices from the less urbanised Wake Valley Pond and Holt Hall Lake are in line with those reported

253 for Swedish lakes and rivers (Hagberg et al, 2005; Lundstedt, 2016). However, those at Edgbaston

254 Pool exceed those reported elsewhere. Similar to the situation for PBDEs, while the lake situated in

the local authority with the highest population density (Edgbaston Pool) has noticeably the highest

256 ΣPBDD/F concentrations; levels of these contaminants are similar at Wake Valley Pond and Holt

Hall Lake despite the former being located in a more densely populated local authority area.

258 PBDFs were overwhelmingly dominant, with OBDD the only PBDD detected and that only in the

259 uppermost two layers in the cores taken at Wake Valley Pond and Holt Hall Lake. This is

260 consistent with previous observations for surficial sediments and atmospheric deposition (Goto et

al, 2017; Hayakawa et al, 2004), as well as in emissions from waste incinerators (Wang et al,

262 2010), and iron ore sintering (Drage et al, 2014). It is also pertinent to note that while OBDD and to

- a far lesser extent penta- and tetra-BDDs have been detected in commercial PBDE formulations
- 264 (Ren et al, 2011), PBDFs especially OBDF and 1,2,3,4,6,7,8-HpBDF were in comparison
- detected in such products at far higher concentrations (Hanari et al, 2006; Ren et al, 2011).

Peters et al 2020 Page 13 of 31

266	Figure 2 shows the homologue profiles of PBDFs in sediment core slices from each lake. It is
267	interesting to note the spatial variation in these profiles, for example TBDFs are far less abundant at
268	Edgbaston Pool than at the other two lakes. A striking observation is that OBDF was detected at
269	Wake Valley Pond - albeit only in the two uppermost core slices (2015 and 2009). To our
270	knowledge, this is the first report of OBDF in sediments. The low detection frequency of OBDF in
271	sediments is perhaps surprising given previous data that reports OBDF to be an impurity in both
272	Octa-BDE and Deca-BDE commercial formulations (Hanari et al, 2006; Ren et al, 2011).
273	However, this may be because OBDF has been reported to be easily debrominated (Goto et al,
274	2017). Overall, the PBDF homologue pattern in our sediment cores (expressed as a percentage of
275	$\Sigma$ PBDFs) more closely resembles that reported for the Octa-BDE formulation which comprises 0.3
276	% TBDFs, 1.8 % PeBDFs, 44.9 % HxBDFs, 27.1 % HpBDFs, and 25.8 % OBDF, than the
277	Deca-BDE formulation which comprises 0.1% for each of TBDFs, PeBDFs, and HxBDFs, 3.6%
278	for HpBDFs, and 96.1% OBDF. While this might suggest the Octa-BDE commercial formulation
279	is a more significant source of the PBDFs observed in our sediments than the Deca-BDE product;
280	as noted above, the major PBDE formulation used in the UK was Deca-BDE. Moreover, we note
281	that concentrations of $\Sigma$ PBDFs are more strongly correlated with those of BDE-209 (R=0.96,
282	p<0.05 and R=0.85, p<0.1) than those of BDE-183 at both Edgbaston Pool and Wake Valley Pond
283	(R=0.48, p>0.1 and R=0.64, p>0.1) - no meaningful inference could be drawn in this regard at Holt
284	Hall Lake as there were too few samples in which PBDFs and both BDEs-183 and -209 were
285	detected.
286	In addition to the potential contribution of PBDE use, both OBDF and 1,2,3,4,6,7,8-HpBDF (the
287	predominant HpBDF detected in this study) have been reported to be emitted from combustion

processes (Wang et al, 2015). We also note that we did not target 288

Peters et al 2020 Page 14 of 31

289 2,7-/2,8-dibromodibenzo-p-dioxins or 1,3,7-/1,3,8-tribromodibenzo-p-dioxins, which have been

identified as being of biogenic origin (Goto et al, 2017) and can therefore not rule out possible

291 contributions from biogenic sources to the burden of PBDD/Fs in our lakes. In summary, drawing

292 firm conclusions about PBDD/F source attribution based on homologue and congener patterns in

293 environmental matrices like lake sediments, is complicated by post-emission modification of such

294 profiles by weathering processes that favour some PBDD/Fs more than others. Notwithstanding

this, the evidence of congener/homologue profiles presented here, suggests that the PBDD/Fs

296 detected in this study are predominantly a complex integral of combustion source emissions and

their presence as contaminants of the Deca-BDE formulation.

298 Temporal Trends in concentrations of *SPBDFs* and *PBDF* homologue patterns

299 Temporal trends in concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDFs are shown in Figure 1. Overall, they reveal a steady 300 rise in concentrations from the 1980s onwards, peaking at the surface (2015) at Edgbaston Pool and 301 Wake Valley Pond, and in the second most recent core slice (dated to 2009) at Holt Hall Lake. Prior 302 to the onset of rising concentrations in the 1980s, concentrations were much lower. Inspection of 303 Figure 1 suggests temporal trends in **SPBDEs** and **SPBDFs** are positively correlated and indeed the 304 correlation coefficient for the three sites is significant, ranging between 0.88-0.98 (p<0.05 at each 305 site). With respect to changes in the homologue pattern over time, Figure 2 reveals no clear trend at 306 Holt Hall Lake. In contrast, there is a marked shift from HpBDFs to HxBDFs in more recent 307 sediment layers at Edgbaston Pool. Meanwhile at Wake Valley Pond, there is a noticeable decline 308 in the abundance of TBDFs, along with increased abundance of HpBDFs in more recent core 309 slices, as well as the aforementioned presence of OBDF in the top two layers (dated to 2009 and 310 2015) only. These variable homologue patterns and temporal trends suggest that changes in the 311 relative contributions of different sources of PBDFs over time differ between our three lakes. To

Peters et al 2020 Page 15 of 31

our knowledge there is only one study with which our data on PBDF homologue patterns in sediment cores can be compared. In this study of a sediment core from Osaka Bay in Japan that covered the period 1904-2000, OBDF was not detected and in declining order of abundance the other homologues followed the order HpBDF>HxBDF>PeBDF>TBDF (Takigami et al, 2005). This homologue pattern most closely resembled that observed in this study at Holt Hall Lake.

318 Concentrations, Relative Abundance, and Temporal Trends of PXDD/Fs in English Lake

319 Sediments

326

327

320 Table 2 reports concentrations of individual PXDD/Fs and homologue groups in each sediment

321 core slice analyzed in this study. Also included in Table 2 are concentrations of 2-Br-3,7,8-CDD,

322 2-Br-3,6,7,8,9-CDD, 2-Br-2,7,8-CDF, and 1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDF reported previously in surficial

323 sediments collected from Osaka Bay, Japan (Ohta et al, 2002). Concentrations of these PXDD/Fs

in our study are of a similar range to those reported for Osaka Bay. As observed for both PBDEs

325 and PBDD/Fs, concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PXDD/Fs at the two lakes studied for these contaminants do not

correspond with the population density of the local authority within which the lake was submitted

(Table SD-1). Specifically, t-test comparison shows PXDD/F concentrations at Wake Valley Pond

328 to be statistically indistinguishable (p>0.05) from those at Holt Hall Lake. For PXDD/Fs, the

329 concentrations detected were typically two orders of magnitude below those of PBDD/Fs. PXDFs

330 were more abundant than PXDDs in every core slice analysed from both locations where PXDD/Fs

331 were determined, with PXDFs typically 2-3 times more abundant. There was no clear temporal

trend in the ratio of PXDFs:PXDDs at either lake. Moreover, the homologue pattern is broadly

333 similar at both lakes and does not appear subject to temporal variation.

Peters et al 2020 Page 16 of 31

334 Temporal trends in concentrations of PXDD/Fs differ between the two lakes in which they were 335 measured. Concentrations at Wake Valley Pond peak in the oldest slice (1954) analyzed at this 336 location and then steadily decrease through to the present (2015). In slight contrast, concentrations 337 at Holt Hall Lake rise from 1935 to 1976, before declining through to the uppermost layer (2015). 338 In contrast to the significant positive correlation between  $\Sigma$ PBDEs and  $\Sigma$ PBDFs at all three lakes, 339 concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDEs are not significantly correlated (p>0.05) with those of  $\Sigma$ PXDD/Fs. 340 Likewise,  $\Sigma$ PBDD/Fs are not correlated with  $\Sigma$ PXDD/Fs (p>0.05). Overall, this suggests that the 341 sources of PXDD/Fs are different to those of PBDD/Fs, and that the manufacture and use of 342 PBDEs does not appear to be a source of PXDD/Fs.

343

#### 344 Conclusions

345 Concentrations of PXDD/Fs in radiometrically-dated sediment cores from 3 English lakes 346 decreased over time to the present. In contrast, concentrations of PBDEs increased towards the present and were significantly correlated with concentrations of PBDFs in all three lakes. These 347 348 findings suggest that PBDEs do not appear to be a source of PXDD/Fs and that the sources of 349 PXDD/Fs are different to those of PBDFs. Moreover, while the correlation between PBDEs and 350 PBDFs implies that increased use of PBDEs has contributed substantially to environmental 351 contamination with PBDFs; examination of PBDF homologue patterns implies emissions from 352 combustion activities such as waste incineration and iron ore sintering are likely also important. 353 Concentrations of PBDEs in all samples are dominated by BDE-209 which is the main consitutent 354 of the Deca-BDE formulation most widely used in the UK. At two of the three lakes studied, the 355 concentrations of BDE-209 were highest in the sediment layers dated to 2012 and 2009, rather than 356 in the surface layer dated to 2015. This may indicate that recent bans and restrictions on the

Peters et al 2020 Page 17 of 31

357	manufacture and use of Deca-BDE may be starting to take effect and reduce concentrations in the
358	environment.

359

#### 360 Acknowledgements

- 361 The research leading to these results has received funding from the Marie Curie Actions of the
- 362 European Union's FP7 Programme under REA grant agreement # 606857 (ELUTE project). The
- analytical work was supported by the RECETOX research infrastructure (LM2018121). We thank
- 364 Ian Patmore for his help in the field, Aristide Ganci for field and lab-work assistance, and Alwyn
- 365 Fernandes for the kind gift of PXDD/F standards. This paper is dedicated to the memory of Dr

366 Leon Peters.

367

#### 368 Supplementary Data

369 Supplementary data to this article can be found online at

370

#### 371 **References**

Bromine Science and Environmental Forum (BSEF) 2003. Major Brominated Flame
 Retardants Volume Estimates: Total Market Demand by Region in 2001, <u>www.bsef.com</u>
 (accessed 21<sup>st</sup> January 2003).

2. Chattkittikunwong, W., Creaser, C. S. 1994. Bromo-, Bromochloro- and
Chloro-Dibenzo-p-Dioxins and Dibenzofurans in Incinerator Flyash. Chemosphere 29,
559-566.

- 378 3. Chen, S. J., Ma, Y. J., Wang, J., Tian, M., Luo, X-J., Chen, D., Mai, B-X. 2010 Measurement
- and human exposure assessment of brominated flame retardants in household products from
- 380 South China. J. Hazard Mater. 176, 979–984.
- 381 4. Choi, J. W., Fujimaki, S., Kitamura, K., Hashimoto, S., Ito, H., Sakurai, T., Suzuki, N.,
- 382 Nagasaka, H., Tanabe, K., Sakai, S., Morita, M. 2003. Historical trends of PBDD/Fs,
- 383 PBDEs, PCDD/Fs, and dioxin like PCBs in sediment cores from Tokyo Bay.
  384 Organohalogen Compd. 61, 119-122.
- 3855. Drage, D. S., Aries, E., Harrad., S. 2014. Studies into the formation of PBDEs and PBDD/Fs
- in the iron ore sintering process. Sci. Tot. Environ. 485-486, 497-507.
- Ganci, A. P., Vane, C. H., Abdallah, M. A.-E., Moehring, T., Harrad, S. 2019. Legacy PBDEs
   and NBFRs in sediments of the tidal River Thames using liquid chromatography coupled to a
   high resolution accurate mass Orbitrap mass spectrometer. Sci. Tot. Environ. 658, 1355–
   1366.
- 391 7. Goto, A., Tue, N. M., Someya, M., Isobe, T., Takahashi, S., Tanabe, S., Kinisue, T. 2017.
  392 Spatio-temporal trends of polybrominated dibenzo-*p*-dioxins and dibenzofurans in archived
  393 sediments from Tokyo Bay, Japan. Sci.Tot. Environ. 599-600, 340-347.
- Hagberg, J., Grahn, E., van Bavel, B., Lindström, G. 2005. Occurrence and levels of
   PCDD/Fs and PBDD/Fs in two Swedish lake sediments. Organohalogen Compd. 67, 2030 2032.
- Hanari, N., Kannan, K., Okazawa, T., Kodavanti, P. R. S., Aldous, K. M., Yamashita, N.
   2006. Occurrence of Polybrominated Biphenyls, Polybrominated Dibenzo-*p*-dioxins, and

Peters et al 2020 Page 19 of 31

- Polybrominated Dibenzofurans as Impurities in Commercial Polybrominated Diphenyl Ether
  Mixtures. Environ. Sci. Technol. 40, 4400–4405.
- 401 10. Harrad, S., Hunter, S. 2006. Concentrations of Polybrominated Diphenyl Ethers in Air and
  402 Soil on a Rural-Urban Transect Across a Major UK Conurbation. Environ. Sci. Technol. 40,
  403 4548-4553.
- 404 11. Hayakawa, K., Takatsuki, H., Watanabe, I., Sakai, S. 2004. Polybrominated diphenyl ethers
  405 (PBDEs), polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins/dibenzofurans (PBDD/Fs) and
  406 monobromo-polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins/dibenzofurans (MoBPXDD/Fs) in the
  407 atmosphere and bulk deposition in Kyoto, Japan. Chemosphere 57, 343–56.
- 408 12. Kannan, K., Watanabe, I., Giesy, J. P. 1998. Congener profile of polychlorinated/brominated
  409 dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in soil and sediments collected at a former chlor-alkali
  410 plant. Toxicol. Environ. Chem. 67, 135-146.
- 411 13. Law, R. J.; Herzke, D.; Harrad, S.; Morris, S.; Bersuder, P.; Allchin, C. R. 2008. Levels and
  412 trends of brominated flame retardants in the European environment. Chemosphere 73, 223–
  413 241.
- 414 14. Kohler, M., Zennegg, M. Bogdal, C., Gerecke, A. C., Schmid, P. V., Heeb, N., Sturm, M., 415 Vonmont, H., Kohler, H-P. E., Giger, W. 2008. Temporal Trends, Congener Patterns, and 416 Sources of Nona-, Decabromodiphenyl (PBDE) Octa-, and Ethers and 417 Hexabromocyclododecanes (HBCD) in Swiss Lake Sediments. Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 418 6378-6384.

419	15. La Guardia, M. J., Hale, R. C., Harvey, E. 2006. Detailed Polybrominated Diphenyl Ether
420	(PBDE) Congener Composition of the Widely Used Penta-, Octa-, and Deca-PBDE Technical
421	Flame-retardant Mixtures. Environ. Sci. Technol. 40, 6247–6254.

- 422 16. Leung, A. O. W., Luksemburg, W. J., Wong, A. S., Wong, M. H. 2007. Spatial Distribution
  423 of Polybrominated Diphenyl Ethers and Polychlorinated Dibenzo-*p*-dioxins and
  424 Dibenzofurans in Soil and Combusted Residue at Guiyu, an Electronic Waste Recycling Site
- 425 in Southeast China. Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 2730–2737.
- 426 17. Lundstedt, S. 2016. Sources and levels of PBDD/Fs in the Swedish environment
  427 https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:945535/FULLTEXT01.pdf. (accessed March 3<sup>rd</sup>
  428 2020).
- 429 18. Ma, J., Kannan, K., Cheng, J., Hori, Y., Wu, Q., Wang, W. 2008. Concentrations, profiles,
- 430 and estimated human exposures for polychlorinated dibenzo p dioxins and dibenzofurans
- from electronic waste recycling facilities and a chemical industrial complex in Eastern China.
- 432 Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 8252 8259.
- 433 19. Ma, J., Addink, R., Yun, S. H., Cheng, J. P., Wang, W. H., Kannan K. 2009. Polybrominated
  434 dibenzo-*p* dioxins/dibenzofurans and polybrominated diphenyl ethers in soil, vegetation,
  435 workshop floor dust, and electronic shredder residue from an electronic waste recycling
  436 facility and in soils from a chemical industrial complex in Eastern China. Environ. Sci.
  437 Technol. 43, 7350 7356.

- 438 20. Mai, B., Chen, S., Luo, X., Chen, L., Yang, Q., Sheng, G., Peng, P., Fu, J., Zeng, E. Y. 2005.
- 439 Distribution of Polybrominated Diphenyl Ethers in Sediments of the Pearl River Delta and
- 440 Adjacent South China Sea. Environ. Sci. Technol. 39, 3521-3527.
- 441 21. Myers, A. L., Mabury, S. A., Reiner, E. J. 2012. Analysis of mixed halogenated
- 442 dibenzo-*p*-dioxins and dibenzofurans (PXDD/PXDFs) in soil by gas chromatography tandem
- 443 mass spectrometry (GC–MS/MS). Chemosphere 87, 1063–1069.
- 444 22. Naturvårdsverket. 2011. Recycling and disposal of electronic waste health hazards and
  445 environmental impacts. 6417.
- http://naturvardsverket.se/Documents/publikationer6400/978-91-620-6417-4.pdf (accessed
  March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2020)
- 23. Ohta, S., Nakao, T., Nishimura, H., Okumura, T., Aozasa, O., Miyata, H. 2002.
  Contamination levels of PBDEs, TBBPA, PCDD/Fs, PBDD/Fs and PXDD/Fs in the
  environment of Japan. Organohalogen Compd. 57, 57-60.
- 451 24. Patmore, I. R., Sayer, C. D., Goldsmith, B., Davidson, T. A., Rawcliffe, R., Salgado, J. 2014.
- Big Ben: A new wide-bore piston corer for multi-proxy palaeolimnology. J. Paleolimnol. 51,
  79–86.
- 454 25. Ramu, K., Isobe, T., Takahashi, S., Subramanian, A., Parthasarathy, P., Tanabe S. 2008.
- 455 Brominated flame retardants and dioxins in soil from electronic waste recycling sites in India.
- 456 Organohalogen Compd. 70, 2058 2061.
- 26. Ren, M., Peng, P., Cai, Y., Chen, D., Zhou, L., Chen, P., Hu, J. 2011. PBDD/F impurities in
  some commercial deca-BDE. Environ. Pollut. 159, 1375-1380.

Peters et al 2020 Page 22 of 31

- 459 27. Takigami, H., Sakai, S., Brouwer, A. 2005. Bio/chemical Analysis of Dioxin-like Compounds
  460 in Sediment Samples from Osaka Bay, Japan. Environ. Technol. 26, 459–70.
- 461 28. Terauchi, H., Takahashi, S., Lam, P. K. S., Min, B-Y., Tanabe, S. 2009. Polybrominated,
- 462 polychlorinated and monobromo-polychlorinated dibenzo-*p*-dioxins/dibenzofurans and
- dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls in marine surface sediments from Hong Kong andKorea. Environ. Pollut. 157, 724-730.
- 465 29. Tue, N. M., Takahashi, S., Subramanian, A., Sakai, S., Tanabe, S. 2013. Environmental
- 466 contamination and human exposure to dioxin-related compounds in e-waste recycling sites of
  467 developing countries. Environ. Sci. Proc. Imp. 15, 1326–1331.
- 468 30. Van den Berg, M., Denison, M. S., Birnbaum, L. S., DeVito, M. J., Fiedler, H., Falandysz, J.,
- 469 Rose, M., Schrenk, D., Safe, S., Tohyama, C., Tritscher, A., Tysklind, M., Peterson, R. E.
- 2013. Polybrominated Dibenzo-*p*-Dioxins, Dibenzofurans, and Biphenyls: Inclusion in the
  Toxicity Equivalency Factor Concept for Dioxin-Like Compounds. Toxicol. Sci. 133, 197208.
- 473 31. Vane, C. H., Ma, Y-J., Chen, S-J., Mai, B-X. Increasing polybrominated diphenyl ether
- 474 (PBDE) contamination in sediment cores from the inner Clyde Estuary, UK. 2010. Environ.
  475 Geochem. Hlth. 32, 13–21.
- 476 32. Wall, R. J., Fernandes, A., Rose, M., Bell, D. R., Mellor, I. R. 2015. Characterisation of
- chlorinated, brominated and mixed halogenated dioxins, furans and biphenyls as potent and
  as partial agonists of the Aryl hydrocarbon receptor. Environ. Int. 76, 49–56.
- 33. Wang, L-C., Hsi, H-C., Wang, Y-F., Lin, S-L, Chang-Chien, G-P. 2010. Distribution of
  polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) and polybrominated dibenzo-p-dioxins and

Peters et al 2020 Page 23 of 31

- 481 dibenzofurans (PBDD/Fs) in municipal solid waste incinerators. Environ. Pollut. 158, 1595–
  482 602.
- 483 34. Wang, M., Liu, G., Jiang, X., Liu, W., Li, L., Li, S., Zheng, M., Zhan, J. 2015. Brominated
  484 dioxin and furan stack gas emissions during different stages of the secondary copper smelting
- 485 process. Atmos. Pollut. Res. 6, 464-468.
- 486 35. Weber, R., Kuch, B. 2003. Relevance of BFRs and thermal conditions on the formation
  487 pathways of brominated and brominated–chlorinated dibenzodioxins and dibenzofurans.
  488 Environ. Int. 29, 699–710.
- 36. Webster, L., Russell, M., Adefehinti, F., Dalgarno, E. J., Moffat, C. F. 2008. Preliminary
  assessment of polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) in the Scottish aquatic environment,
  including the Firth of Clyde. J. Environ. Monit. 10, 463–473.
- 492 37. Yang, C., Rose, N.L., Turner, S.D., Yang, H., Goldsmith, B., Losada, S., Barber, J. L., Harrad,
- 493 S. 2016. Hexabromocyclododecanes, polybrominated diphenyl ethers, and polychlorinated
- 494 biphenyls in radiometrically dated sediment cores from English lakes, ~ 1950–present. Sci.
- 495 Tot. Environ. 541, 721–728.
- 496 38. Yu, X., Zennegg, M., Engwall, M., Rotander, A., Larsson, M., Wong, M. H., Weber, R. 2008.
- 497 E-Waste Recycling Heavily Contaminates a Chinese City with Chlorinated, Brominated and
- 498 Mixed Halogenated Dioxins. Organohalogen Compd. 70, 813-816.
- 499 39. Zegers, B. N., Lewis, W. E., Booij, K., Smittenberg, R. H., Boer, W., de Boer, J., Boon, J. P.
- 500 2003. Levels of polybrominated diphenyl ether flame retardants in sediment cores from
- 501 Western Europe. Environ. Sci. Technol. 37, 3803–3807.

Peters et al 2020 Page 24 of 31

502	40. Zennegg, M., Yu, X., Wong, M. H., Weber, R. 2009. Fingerprints of Chlorinated, Brominated
503	and Mixed Halogenated Dioxins at Two E-Waste Recycling Sites in Guiyu/China.
504	Organohalogen Compd. 71, 2248-2252.

- 505 41. Zhang, X-L., Luo, X-J., Chen, S-J., Wu, J-P., Mai, B-X. 2009. Spatial distribution and
- 506 vertical profile of polybrominated diphenyl ethers, tetrabromobisphenol A, and
- 507 decabromodiphenylethane in river sediment from an industrialized region of South China.
- 508 Environ. Pollut. 157, 1917–1923
- 509 42. Zhou, L., Li, H., Yu, Z., Ren, M., Zeng, X., Peng, P., Sheng, G., Fu, J. 2012. Chlorinated and
- 510 brominated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans in surface sediment from Taihu Lake, China.
- 511 J. Environ. Monit. 14, 1935-1942.

Table 1: Concentrations of  $\Sigma$ PBDEs and  $\Sigma$ PBDD/Fs (ng/g dry weight) in surficial sediments from this study with those in soil and sediments from selected other studies 512 513

Matrix, Location	<b>ΣPBDD/F</b>	<b>ΣPBDE</b>	Reference
Fresh water sediments			
Edgbaston Pool, UK	7.1	210	This Study
Holt Hall Lake, UK	0.49	18	This Study
Wake Valley Pond, UK	0.49	21	This Study
Edgbaston Pool, UK <sup>a</sup>	-	120	Yang et al, 2016
Holt Hall Lake, UK <sup>a</sup>	-	10	Yang et al, 2016
Wake Valley Pond, UK <sup>a</sup>	-	9.8	Yang et al, 2016
Surficial Sediments, River Thames, UK	-	180 (mean	) Ganci et al, 2019
Clyde Estuary, UK (core slices)	-	1-2,600	Vane et al, 2010
Scotland, UK (core slices)	-	2.3-98,000	Webster et, 2008
Rural/urban lakes, Sweden	0.44-0.54	-	Hagberg et al, 2005
Urban river, Sweden	0.41-1.7	29-62	Lundstedt, 2016
Rural lake Sweden	0.082-0.085	4.4-16	Lundstedt, 2016
Urban lake, China	0.00048-0.0057	7 -	Zhou et al, 2012
Stream at dump site, Peru	0.012-0.074	3.7-6.1	Naturvårdsverket, 2011
Lake, industrial area, Thailand	0.037-1.5	3.4-58	Naturvårdsverket, 2011
Marine sediments			
Hong Kong/Korea	nd0.46	-	Terauchi et al, 2009
Tokyo Bay, Japan	0.0052-0.070	10-78,050	Choi et al, 2003
Osaka, Japan	0.0041-0.077	8.0-352	Ohta et al, 2002
Osaka, Japan	0.0024-0.59	53-910	Takigami et al, 2005
Coastal and offshore, Sweden	0.050-10	-	Lundstedt, 2016
Rural Soil			
Lanna, Sweden	0.028-0.054	0.065-1.3	Lundstedt, 2016
Urban soil			
Umeå and Norrköping, Sweden	0.0011-0.22	0.18-66	Lundstedt, 2016
Bangalore and Chennai, India	0.0060-0.31	-	Ramu et al, 2008
Kyoto, Japan	0.28	-	Hayakawa et al, 2004
Industrial area, China	nd0.43	2.03-269	Ma et al, 2008; Ma et al, 2009
Industrial area, Thailand	0.019-0.16	1.8-13	Naturvårdsverket, 2011
Dump site, Peru	0.0086-0.32	3.6-92	Naturvårdsverket, 2011

<sup>a</sup>Data for core slices dated to 2008 for Edgbaston Pool and for 2009 for both Holt Hall Lake and Wake Valley Pond. 514

515

## Table 2: Concentrations (pg/g OC) of PXDD/Fs in Sediment Core Slices from Wake Valley Pond and Holt Hall Lake with Comparative Data from Osaka Bay, Japan

Location	Congener/ Homologue/ Year	2015	2009	2005	2004	1999	1993	1985	1977	1969	1965	1954	1935
Wake Valley Pond	2-Br-7,8-CDD	0.023	0.16	0.24		0.32	0.4	0.035			0.079	< 0.032	
Holt Hall Lake	2-Br-7,8-CDD	1.1	2.8		2.6	3.4		1.1	< 0.025	< 0.024		< 0.021	< 0.021
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-2CDD	0.73	1.9	1.9		2.7	2.3	3.6			0.8	9.3	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-2CDD	1.8	4.1		4.0	5.3		2.2	11	7.1		2.3	< 0.021
Wake Valley Pond	2-Br-3,7,8-CDD	0.081	< 0.028	< 0.027		0.12	0.22	0.22			0.29	< 0.047	
Holt Hall Lake	2-Br-3,7,8-CDD	0.02	0.049		0.054	0.16		0.08	1.4	< 0.035		< 0.031	< 0.03
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	2-Br-3,7,8-CDD						0.84	-6.5					
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-3CDD	1.5	2.2	2.8		3.8	3	3.5			6.2	9.3	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-3CDD	0.77	2.1		2.4	2.7		2.4	18	< 0.027		< 0.019	< 0.018
Wake Valley Pond	2,3-Br-7,8-CDD	< 0.015	< 0.017	< 0.016		< 0.016	< 0.017	< 0.016			< 0.016	< 0.029	
Holt Hall Lake	2,3-Br-7,8-CDD	< 0.013	0.095		0.062	< 0.018		0.034	< 0.022	< 0.021		< 0.019	< 0.018
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	2,3-Br-7,8-CDD	Not detected											
Wake Valley Pond	Total 2Br-2CDD	0.48	0.64	0.87		1.2	1.5	1.8			1.2	4.4	
Holt Hall Lake	Total 2Br-2CDD	0.33	0.79		0.82	1.1		0.97	5.0	2.2		0.62	< 0.017
Wake Valley Pond	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDD + 2-Br-1,3,7,8-CDD*	< 0.018	< 0.021	0.37		< 0.02	< 0.021	< 0.02			< 0.021	< 0.032	
Holt Hall Lake	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDD + 2-Br-1,3,7,8-CDD*	< 0.016	< 0.019		< 0.02	< 0.023		< 0.027	< 0.028	< 0.027		< 0.024	< 0.023
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDD						Not de	etected					
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-4CDD	1.7	1.8	2.8		3.8	5.9	4.6			7	5.7	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-4CDD	0.47	1.9		1.0	1.9		< 0.021	< 0.022	< 0.021		0.71	< 0.018
Wake Valley Pond	2-Br-3,6,7,8,9-CDD	< 0.015	< 0.017	< 0.016		< 0.016	< 0.017	< 0.016			< 0.016	< 0.029	
Holt Hall Lake	2-Br-3,6,7,8,9-CDD	< 0.013	< 0.015		< 0.016	< 0.018		0.6	< 0.022	< 0.021		< 0.019	< 0.018
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	2-Br-3,6,7,8,9-CDD				1		Not detec	ted - 0.32	1	1			
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-5CDD	1	0.82	3.5		2.2	5.1	7			7.5	15	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-5CDD	< 0.018	0.11		< 0.01	< 0.012		0.6	< 0.022	< 0.021		< 0.019	< 0.018

Location	Congener/ Homologue/ Year	2015	2009	2005	2004	1999	1993	1985	1977	1969	1965	1954	1935
Wake Valley Pond	2-Br-7,8-CDF	0.77	1	0.88		< 0.01	2	2.7			< 0.01	< 0.018	
Holt Hall Lake	2-Br-7,8-CDF	< 0.008	< 0.01		< 0.01	< 0.012		0.53	< 0.014	< 0.013		< 0.012	< 0.012
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-2CDF	6.9	16	16		26	17	25			22	62	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-2CDF	4.7	7.9		7.7	12		9.6	88	89		15	9.5
Wake Valley Pond	2-Br-6,7,8-CDF + 3-Br-2,7,8-CDF*	< 0.012	0.13	0.17		0.3	0.65	0.46			0.076	< 0.023	
Holt Hall Lake	2-Br-6,7,8-CDF + 3-Br-2,7,8-CDF*	0.07	0.28		0.18	0.40		1.3	5.1	< 0.017		0.63	< 0.015
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	3-Br-2,7,8-CDF						Not det	ected-2.0		1			J
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-3CDF	4.3	6	6.4		8.4	8.7	10			11	57	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-3CDF	2.5	4.8		5.3	8.8		5.0	44	49		6.6	3.1
Wake Valley Pond	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDF	0.022	< 0.014	0.047		0.042	0.66	< 0.012			< 0.012	< 0.021	
Holt Hall Lake	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDF	< 0.009	< 0.011		< 0.012	< 0.014		< 0.016	< 0.017	< 0.016		< 0.014	< 0.014
Osaka Bay, Japan <sup>a</sup>	1-Br-2,3,7,8-CDF				•	•	Not d	etected	•		•		
Wake Valley Pond	Total Br-4CDF	1.5	1.6	2.6		3.6	6.4	5.8			2	20	
Holt Hall Lake	Total Br-4CDF	1.8	5.0		2.4	5.2		0.81	7.3	< 0.016		3.5	4.4
Wake Valley Pond	∑PXDD	5.4	7.5	12		14	18	20			23	43	
Holt Hall Lake	∑PXDD	3.3	9.1		8.2	11		6.0	34	9.3		7.1	< 0.03
Wake Valley Pond	∑PXDF	13	24	25		38	32	41			34	140	
Holt Hall Lake	∑PXDF	9.0	18		15	26		15	140	140		25	17
Wake Valley Pond	∑PXDD/F	18	31	37		51	50	61			57	180	
Holt Hall Lake	∑PXDD/F	12	27		24	37		21	170	150		32	17

<sup>a</sup>Range (pg/g dry weight) surficial sediments from Osaka, Japan (n=6) (Ohta et al, 2002) – detection limits not reported

519

### Figure 1: Temporal Trends in Concentrations (ng/g OC) of ΣPBDE, ΣPBDF, and ΣPXDD/F in 3 English Lake Sediment Cores

522





## 526 Figure 2: Temporal Trends in Relative Contributions of PBDF Homologues to ΣPBDF 527 Concentrations in 3 English Lake Sediment Cores

Peters et al 2020 Page 30 of 31



531